Thimbles: A Geometric Solution to the Sign Problem

Neill Warrington University of Maryland College Park

In collaboration with: Paulo Bedaque, Andrei Alexandru, Gökçe Başar, Greg Ridgway

Roadmap:

- The Sign Problem
- Motivational 1D example
- Thimbles in path integrals
- The Beltway Algorithm
- Application to Relativistic Bose Gas at Finite Density

Observables in QFT

 $\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{1}{Z} \int \mathcal{O}[\phi] \mathrm{e}^{-S[\phi]} D[\phi]$ $Z = \int e^{-S[\phi]} D[\phi]$

 $\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{1}{Z} \int \mathcal{O}[\phi] \mathrm{e}^{-S[\phi]} D[\phi]$

 $Z = \int e^{-S[\phi]} D[\phi]$

Observables in QFT

In practice, generate fields $\{\phi_i\}$ distributed as $\Pr[\phi] = \frac{e^{-\delta_{[\psi]}}}{Z}$

 $\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{1}{Z} \int \mathcal{O}[\phi] \mathrm{e}^{-S[\phi]} D[\phi]$

 $Z = \int e^{-S[\phi]} D[\phi]$

Observables in QFT

In practice, generate fields $\{\phi_i\}$ distributed as $\Pr[\phi] = \frac{e^{-S[\phi]}}{Z}$

Then,
$$\langle \mathcal{O}
angle = rac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \mathcal{O}[\phi_i] \,$$
 with statistical errors

 $\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{1}{Z} \int \mathcal{O}[\phi] \mathrm{e}^{-S[\phi]} D[\phi]$

 $Z = \int e^{-S[\phi]} D[\phi]$

Observables in QFT

In practice, generate fields $\{\phi_i\}$ distributed as $\Pr[\phi] = \frac{e^{-\beta[\phi]}}{7}$

Then,
$$\langle \mathcal{O}
angle = rac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \mathcal{O}[\phi_i] \,$$
 with statistical errors

But if $S = S_R + iS_I$ then what? You've got a "sign problem".

A complex action occurs in a variety of situations

A complex action occurs in a variety of situations

1. QCD at finite chemical potential

- A complex action occurs in a variety of situations
 - 1. QCD at finite chemical potential
 - 2. Most theories with a chemical potential

- A complex action occurs in a variety of situations
 - 1. QCD at finite chemical potential
 - 2. Most theories with a chemical potential
 - 3. Hubbard Model away from half filling

- A complex action occurs in a variety of situations
 - 1. QCD at finite chemical potential
 - 2. Most theories with a chemical potential
 - 3. Hubbard Model away from half filling
 - 4. Any real time dynamics, etc...

- A complex action occurs in a variety of situations
 - 1. QCD at finite chemical potential
 - 2. Most theories with a chemical potential
 - 3. Hubbard Model away from half filling
 - 4. Any real time dynamics, etc...

So, is there a way around?

$$\begin{array}{l} \label{eq:rescaled} \mathsf{Reweighting} \\ \rangle = \frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d^n \phi}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi)} d^n \phi} \end{array}$$

 $\langle \mathcal{O}$

$$=\frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d^n \phi}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} d^n \phi} \frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} d^n \phi}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi)} d^n \phi}$$



Geometric Solution



Thimble = a surface of steepest descent/stationary phase





 $z(\tau) \xrightarrow{\tau \to \infty} z_c$

To find thimbles, solve flow equations

Rewriting
$$z(\tau) = x(\tau) + iy(\tau)$$
:

$$\frac{dx}{d\tau} = -\frac{\partial S_R}{\partial x} = -\frac{\partial S_I}{\partial y}$$
$$\frac{dy}{d\tau} = -\frac{\partial S_R}{\partial y} = \frac{\partial S_I}{\partial x}$$

$$\frac{dz}{d\tau} = -\left(\frac{\overline{\partial S}}{\partial z}\right)$$

$$z(\tau) \xrightarrow{\tau \to \infty} z_c$$

To find thimbles, solve flow equations

$$\frac{dz}{d\tau} = -\left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial z}\right)$$

$$z(\tau) \xrightarrow{\tau \to \infty} z_c$$

Rewriting $z(\tau) = x(\tau) + iy(\tau)$:

$$\frac{dx}{d\tau} = \begin{pmatrix} \partial S_R \\ \partial x \end{pmatrix} = -\frac{\partial S_I}{\partial y} \\ \frac{dy}{d\tau} = -\frac{\partial S_R}{\partial y} = \frac{\partial S_I}{\partial x}$$

Gradient Flow of S_R

To find thimbles, solve flow equations

Rewriting
$$z(\tau) = x(\tau) + iy(\tau)$$
:

 $\frac{dx}{d\tau} = -\frac{\partial S_R}{\partial x} = -\frac{\partial S_I}{\partial y}$ $\frac{dy}{d\tau} = -\frac{\partial S_R}{\partial y} = \frac{\partial S_I}{\partial x}$ Hamiltonian

Gradient Flow of S_R

Hamiltonian Flow of S_I

 $\frac{dz}{d\tau} = -$

 $z(\tau) \xrightarrow{\tau \to \infty} z_c$

 $\left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial z}\right)$

$\begin{array}{l} 1 \text{D} \text{ Example} \\ \text{1D Example: } S(z) = -z^2 + z^4 + (h_R + ih_I)z \end{array}$





1D Example

In general:







Harder to see (no pictures):

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^n} e^{-S(x)} f(x) dx = \sum_{\sigma=0}^N n_\sigma e^{-iS_I(\sigma)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_\sigma} e^{-S(z)} f(z) dz$$

Harder to see (no pictures):

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^n} e^{-S(x)} f(x) dx = \sum_{\sigma=0}^N n_\sigma e^{-iS_I(\sigma)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_\sigma} e^{-S(z)} f(z) dz$$

Recall:
$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{\int e^{-S(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d^n \phi}{\int e^{-S(\phi)} d^n \phi}$$

Harder to see (no pictures):

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^n} e^{-S(x)} f(x) dx = \sum_{\sigma=0}^N n_\sigma e^{-iS_I(\sigma)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_\sigma} e^{-S(z)} f(z) dz$$

Recall:
$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{\int e^{-S(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d^n \phi}{\int e^{-S(\phi)} d^n \phi}$$

$$\implies \langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{\sum_{\sigma=0}^{N} n_{\sigma} e^{-iS_{I}(\sigma)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_{\sigma}} e^{-S_{R}(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d^{n} \phi}{\sum_{\sigma=0}^{N} n_{\sigma} e^{-iS_{I}(\sigma)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_{\sigma}} e^{-S_{R}(\phi)} d^{n} \phi}$$

Start with one thimble integration: $\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle_0 = \frac{\int_{\mathcal{T}_0} e^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d^n \phi}{\int_{\mathcal{T}_0} e^{-S_R(\phi)} d^n \phi}$



Generate points **on the thimble** according to: $o^{-S_R(\phi)}$

$$\Pr[\phi] = \frac{\mathrm{e}^{-R(\phi)}}{\int_{\mathcal{T}_0} \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)}}$$

Non-trivial task!





Near critical point,

$$\frac{d\phi_i}{d\tau} = -\left(\frac{\overline{\partial S}}{\partial\phi_i}\right) \simeq -\overline{H_{ij}\phi_j}$$

 \implies spanned by $\{\hat{\rho}_i\}$ such that $\overline{H\hat{\rho}_i} = \lambda_i\hat{\rho}_i$

$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{\int e^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d\phi}{\int e^{-S_R(\phi)} d\phi} = \frac{\int e^{-S_R(\tilde{\phi})} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) \det\left(\frac{d\phi}{d\tilde{\phi}}\right) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int e^{-S_R(\tilde{\phi})} \det\left(\frac{d\phi}{d\tilde{\phi}}\right) d\tilde{\phi}}$$
$$\equiv J = e^{\operatorname{Re}(\ln J) + i\operatorname{Im}(\ln J)}$$

$$\begin{split} \langle \mathcal{O} \rangle &= \frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d\phi}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} d\phi} = \frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\tilde{\phi})} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) \mathrm{det}\left(\frac{d\phi}{d\tilde{\phi}}\right) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\tilde{\phi})} \mathrm{det}\left(\frac{d\phi}{d\tilde{\phi}}\right) d\tilde{\phi}} \\ &\equiv J = \mathrm{e}^{\mathrm{Re}(lnJ) + i\mathrm{Im}(lnJ)} \\ &\equiv S_{eff} \\ &= \frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-\left(S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \mathrm{Re}(lnJ)\right)} \mathrm{e}^{i\mathrm{Im}(lnJ)} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-\left(S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \mathrm{Re}(lnf)\right)} \mathrm{e}^{i\mathrm{Im}(lnJ)} d\tilde{\phi}} \equiv \text{``residual phase''} \end{split}$$

$$\begin{split} \langle \mathcal{O} \rangle &= \frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_{R}(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d\phi}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_{R}(\phi)} d\phi} = \frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_{R}(\tilde{\phi})} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) \mathrm{det}\left(\frac{d\phi}{d\tilde{\phi}}\right) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-S_{R}(\tilde{\phi})} \mathrm{det}\left(\frac{d\phi}{d\tilde{\phi}}\right) d\tilde{\phi}} \\ &\equiv J = \mathrm{e}^{\mathrm{Re}(lnJ) + i\mathrm{Im}(lnJ)} \\ &= \frac{\int \mathrm{e}^{-\left(S_{R}(\tilde{\phi}) - \mathrm{Re}(lnJ)\right)} \mathrm{e}^{i\mathrm{Im}(lnJ)} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int \mathrm{e}^{-\left(S_{R}(\tilde{\phi}) - \mathrm{Re}(lnf)\right)} \mathrm{e}^{i\mathrm{Im}(lnJ)} d\tilde{\phi}} \equiv \text{"residual phase"} \\ &= \frac{\langle \mathcal{O}\mathrm{e}^{i\mathrm{Im}(lnJ)} \rangle_{S_{eff}}}{\langle \mathrm{e}^{i\mathrm{Im}(lnJ)} \rangle_{S_{eff}}} \end{split}$$

Beltway Algorithm $(\phi, S_R) = (\tilde{\phi}, S_{eff})$





$$S[\phi] = \int \left(|\partial \phi|^2 + (m^2 - \mu^2) |\phi|^2 + \mu j_0 + \lambda |\phi|^4 + h(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \right) d^4 x$$

Where: $\phi = \phi_1 + i\phi_2$

 $j_0 = 2i \operatorname{Im} \left(\phi \partial_0 \phi^* - \phi^* \partial_0 \phi \right)$

$$S[\phi] = \int \left(|\partial \phi|^2 + (m^2 - \mu^2) |\phi|^2 + \mu j_0 + \lambda |\phi|^4 + h(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \right) d^4 x$$

Where: $\phi = \phi_1 + i\phi_2$

$$j_0 = 2i \operatorname{Im} \left(\phi \partial_0 \phi^* - \phi^* \partial_0 \phi \right)$$

Here's the sign problem!

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{Relativistic Bose Gas} \\ S[\phi] &= \int \left(|\partial \phi|^2 + (m^2 - \mu^2) |\phi|^2 + \mu j_0 + \lambda |\phi|^4 + h(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \right) d^4x \\ \text{Where: } \phi &= \phi_1 + i\phi_2 \\ j_0 &= 2i \text{Im} (\phi \partial_0 \phi^* - \phi^* \partial_0 \phi) & \qquad \text{Here's the sign problem!} \\ S &= \left(4 + \frac{m^2}{2} \right) \sum_{x,a} \phi_{a,x}^2 - \sum_{x,a} \sum_{\nu=1}^3 \left(\phi_{a,x} \phi_{a,x+\hat{\nu}} \right) \\ &+ \sum_{x,a,b} \left(\cosh \mu \ \phi_{a,x} \phi_{b,x+\hat{0}} \delta_{a,b} \quad i \sinh \mu \ \epsilon_{ab} \phi_{a,x} \phi_{b,x+\hat{0}} \right) \\ &+ \frac{\lambda}{4} \sum_x \left(\phi_{1,x}^2 + \phi_{2,x}^2 \right)^2 + h \sum_x \phi_{1,x} + \phi_{2,x} \end{aligned}$$

Global min of $S[\phi] \implies$ constant field solution

Global min of $S[\phi] \implies$ constant field solution



Global min of $S[\phi] \implies$ constant field solution





Is there a sign problem?



Is there a sign problem?



Phase due to curvature?







Compromise: Reweighting

$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(J)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(J)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} d\tilde{\phi}}$$

Compromise: Reweighting

$$\begin{split} \langle \mathcal{O} \rangle &= \frac{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(J)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(J)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} d\tilde{\phi}} \\ &= \frac{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(W_1)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Re}\left[\log(J) - \log(W_1)\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(J)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Re}\left[\log(J) - \log(W_1)\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} d\tilde{\phi}} \end{split}$$

Modified distribution

"reweighting factor"

Compromise: Reweighting

$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(J)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(J)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} d\tilde{\phi}}$$

$$= \frac{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(W_1)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Re}\left[\log(J) - \log(W_1)\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} \mathcal{O}(\tilde{\phi}) d\tilde{\phi}}{\int e^{-\left[S_R(\tilde{\phi}) - \operatorname{Re}[\log(J)]\right]} e^{\operatorname{Re}\left[\log(J) - \log(W_1)\right]} e^{\operatorname{Im}(\log(J))} d\tilde{\phi}}$$

Modified distribution

"reweighting factor"

$$= \frac{\langle \mathrm{e}^{\mathrm{Re}\left[\log(J) - \log(W_{1})\right]} \mathrm{e}^{\mathrm{Im}(\log(J))} \mathcal{O} \rangle_{S_{R}(\tilde{\phi}) - \mathrm{Re}\left[\log(W_{1})\right]}}{\langle \mathrm{e}^{\mathrm{Re}\left[\log(J) - \log(W_{1})\right]} \mathrm{e}^{\mathrm{Im}(\log(J))} \rangle_{S_{R}(\tilde{\phi}) - \mathrm{Re}\left[\log(W_{1})\right]}}$$

The Estimators

The problem: $\log(J) = \log(\det(M)) \sim \mathcal{O}(N^3)$

Solution 1:
$$\log(W_1) = \int_{0}^{T_{flow}} dt' \sum_{a} \rho_a^{\dagger} \overline{H}(t') \overline{\rho_a} \sim \mathcal{O}(N)$$

Solution 2:
$$\log(W_2) = \int_{0}^{T_{flow}} dt' \operatorname{Tr}(\overline{H(t')}) \sim \mathcal{O}(N)$$

Just reweigh after the fact!

Do they work?





[1] H. Fujii, D. Honda, M. Kato, Y. Kikukawa, S. Komatsu, and T. Sano. Hybrid Monte Carlo on Lefschetz thimbles- A study of the residual sign problem. JHEP, 10:147, 2013.

Conclusions

- One thimble computations below μ_c
- Fast jacobian estimator makes algorithm possible
- Analysis of Bose gas above μ_c possible with alternate surfaces

Marching on

- Perfect simultaneous multi-thimble calculations
- Application to real time dynamics
- Thimbles in gauge theories

Backup Slides





Thimbles of...



Charge: Tangent Plane



[2] H. Fujii, D. Honda, M. Kato, Y. Kikukawa, S. Komatsu, and T. Sano. Hybrid Monte Carlo on Lefschetz thimbles- A study of the residual sign problem. JHEP, 10:147, 2013.



Multi-Thimble

$$\begin{split} \langle \mathcal{O} \rangle &= \frac{n_1 \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi_1)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_1} \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d\phi + n_2 \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi_2)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_2} \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) d\phi}{n_1 \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi_1)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_1} \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} d\phi + n_2 \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi_2)} \int_{\mathcal{T}_2} \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)} d\phi} \\ &= \frac{\langle \tilde{\mathcal{O}} \rangle}{\langle \tilde{\mathbb{I}} \rangle} \end{split}$$

$$\Pr[\phi] = \frac{\mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)}}{Z} \quad Z = \int_{\mathcal{T}_1 \cup \mathcal{T}_2} \mathrm{e}^{-S_R(\phi)}$$

$$\tilde{\mathcal{O}}(\phi) = \begin{cases} n_1 \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi_1)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) & \phi \in \mathcal{T}_1 \\ n_2 \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi_2)} \mathcal{O}(\phi) & \phi \in \mathcal{T}_2 \end{cases}$$

$$\tilde{\mathbb{I}}(\phi) = \begin{cases} n_1 \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi_1)} & \phi \in \mathcal{T}_1 \\ n_2 \mathrm{e}^{-iS_I(\phi_2)} & \phi \in \mathcal{T}_2 \end{cases}$$



Multi-Thimble

