Nuclear matter with chiral three-nucleon forces

A. Carbone, A. Rios and A. Polls In collaboration with A. Cipollone and C. Barbieri

2nd April 2013 - INT Program "Computational And Theoretical Advances For Exotic Isotopes In The Medium Mass Region"





Universitat de Barcelona



Outline:

- * Nuclear matter & the importance of adding three-nucleon forces (3NF)
- * Our approach to nuclear matter:
 - * the self-consistent Green's functions (SCGF) approach with 3NF
 - include 3NF as a density dependent 2NF
- Results
- Conclusions & Outlooks

Outline:

- Nuclear matter & the importance of adding three-nucleon forces (3NF)
- * Our approach to nuclear matter:
 - * the self-consistent Green's functions (SCGF) approach with 3NF
 - include 3NF as a density dependent 2NF
- Results
- Conclusions & Outlooks

Nuclear Matter



What do we know about it?

Empirical saturation properties $E_0 = -16$ MeV, $\varrho_0 = 0.16$ fm⁻³

Symmetry Energy S ≈ 30 MeV

Compressibility K ≈ 200/250 MeV

2solar mass neutron star observed (Demorest *et al.* Nature 467, 1081, 2010)

The importance of adding 3NF

- During the past decades several <u>realistic nucleon-nucleon</u> (NN) <u>interactions</u> have been developed:
 - * Paris potentials, *Lacombe et al.* 1980
 - * Nijmegen potentials, *Stocks et al.* 1994
 - * Argonne potentials, *Wiringa et al.* 1995
 - * Bonn potentials, *Machleidt et al.* 1996



Baldo *et al.*, PRC 86, 064001 (2012)



Good thing: reproduce data from Nijmegen database

<u>Bad thing</u>: don't reproduce nuclei binding energies nor saturation properties of nuclear matter

The importance of adding 3NF

Going back in time:

2-pion exchange attractive term



Other 3NF potentials came afterwards:

- * Tucson-Melbourn potentials, Coon et al. 1979
- * TNI potentials, *Lagaris et al.* 1981
- Urbana and Illinois potentials, Carlson et al. 1983

Progress of Theoretical Physics, Vol. 17, No. 3, March 1957

Pion Theory of Three-Body Forces

Jun-ichi FUJITA and Hironari MIYAZAWA

Department of Physics, University of Tokyo, Tokyo

(Received October 27, 1956)

helps overcome underbinding of nuclei, worsens overbinding of SNM

> 2-pion exchange attractive term + repulsive phenomenological term

The importance of adding 3NF.... in nuclei

SCGF theory for finite nuclei using SRG evolved chiral NN + 3NF forces:



Cipollone et al. arxiv:1303.4900v1

See also H. Hergert *et al.* arxiv:1302.7294

The importance of adding 3NF... a chiral approach

- <u>Chiral EFT generates consistently the NN</u> force and many-body forces
- * State-of-the-art of 2NF chiral force:
 - * N3LO (EM 2003, EGM 2005)
 - optimized version of N2LO recently published (Ekström *et al.* arXiv: 1303.4674v1)
- * State-of-the-art of 3NF chiral force:
 - * N2LO (ENGKMW 2004)
 - N3LO (IR 2007, BEKM 2008,2011)
 - * N4LO (KGE 2012)



Machleidt, Phys. Rep. 503, 1 (2011)

The importance of adding 3NF... a chiral approach

- * In the present work we use:
 - 2NF N3LO (Entem and Machleidt, PRC 68, 041001, 2003)
 - * 3NF N2LO (Epelbaum *et al.* PRC 70, 061002, 2004) in a density dependent form developed by Holt *et al.* PRC 81, 024002 (2010)
 - Low-energy constants are fit to NN and pi-N data;
 - Two constants appearing in the onepion and contact term of the 3NF remain free



The importance of adding 3NF... in nuclear matter

* SCGF theory for nucler matter using chiral NN + 3NF forces:



Outline:

- * Nuclear matter & the importance of adding three-nucleon forces (3NF)
- * Our approach to nuclear matter:
 - * the self-consistent Green's functions (SCGF) approach with 3NF
 - include 3NF as a density dependent 2NF
- Results
- Conclusions & Outlooks

Outline:

- * Nuclear matter & the importance of adding three-nucleon forces (3NF)
- * Our approach to nuclear matter:
 - * the self-consistent Green's functions (SCGF) approach with 3NF
 - include 3NF as a density dependent 2NF
- * Results
- Conclusions & Outlooks

The SCGF approach in very few words

- * A <u>non-relativistic quantum many-body theory</u> originally developed in the 1950's
- * Applyed to atomic, condensed matter, electron gas, **nuclei and nuclear matter** physics (reviews: Dickhoff & Barbieri, PPNP 52, 377, 2004; Müether & Polls, PPNP 45, 243, 2000)
- * It is based on the use of the <u>Green's function or single-particle (SP) propagator</u> :

The SCGF approach in very few words

- * A <u>non-relativistic quantum many-body theory</u> originally developed in the 1950's
- Applyed to atomic, condensed matter, electron gas, nuclei and nuclear matter physics (reviews: Dickhoff & Barbieri, PPNP 52, 377, 2004; Müether & Polls, PPNP 45, 243, 2000)
- * It is based on the use of the <u>Green's function or single-particle (SP) propagator</u> :

$$G_{\alpha\alpha'}(E) = \sum_{m} \frac{\langle \Psi_{0}^{N} | a_{\alpha} | \Psi_{m}^{N+1} \rangle \langle \Psi_{m}^{N+1} | a_{\alpha'}^{\dagger} | \Psi_{0}^{N} \rangle}{E - (E_{m}^{N+1} - E_{0}^{N}) + i\eta} + \sum_{n} \frac{\langle \Psi_{0}^{N} | a_{\alpha'}^{\dagger} | \Psi_{n}^{N-1} \rangle \langle \Psi_{n}^{N-1} | a_{\alpha} | \Psi_{0}^{N} \rangle}{E - (E_{0} - E_{n}^{N-1}) + i\eta}$$

The SCGF approach in very few words

- The SP propagator is directly connected to the <u>spectral function</u>:
 - defines the nucleon distribution in momentum/energy space



The SCGF approach for SNM

- Start with a given spectral function, hence a SP propagator, and an NN interaction
- Construct an effective interaction in the medium, the <u>T matrix</u>, summing up iteratively the so called *ladder diagrams*
- Calculate the SP self-energy and other microscopic properties
- Calculate once again the SP propagator through Dyson's equation



Procedure is repetead until self-consistency is achieved

















16

The SCGF approach for SNM with 3NF

- Start with a given spectral function, hence a SP propagator, and effective interactions
- Construct an effective interaction in the medium, the <u>T matrix</u>, summing up iteratively the so called *ladder diagrams*
- Calculate the SP self-energy and other microscopic properties
- Calculate once again the SP propagator through Dyson's equation

Procedure is repetead until self-consistency is achieved





The main message: <u>you can't define an effective two-body interaction</u> <u>and include it right away in your many-body theory!</u> (Bogner *et al.* PPNP 65, 94, 2010; Hebeler *et al.* PRC 82, 014314, 2010)



All 3-body interaction irreducible diagrams are omitted in this approach, i.e. those coming from a T³ matrix



The Koltun sumrule for the energy

* We need to calculate the total energy of the system:

$$E^{N} = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{H} | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$

* We have the Koltun sumrule to calculate the total energy of the system: first developed by Galitskii and Migdal (1958), later applied to finite system by Koltun ('70s)

$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger} [a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 2 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$
$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger} [a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{E^{N} - E^{N-1}} dE E \frac{1}{\pi} \text{Im} G(\alpha, \alpha'; E)$$

The Koltun sumrule for the energy

* We need to calculate the total energy of the system:

$$E^{N} = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{H} | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$

* We have the Koltun sumrule to calculate the total energy of the system: first developed by Galitskii and Migdal (1958), later applied to finite system by Koltun ('70s)

$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 2 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle \\ \sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{E^{N} - E^{N-1}} dE E \frac{1}{\pi} \text{Im} \, G(\alpha, \alpha'; E) \\ \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{-\infty} dE E \frac{1}{\pi} \text{Im} \, G(\alpha, \alpha'; E) \end{array} \right\}$$
The spectral function
$$\frac{E}{A} = \frac{\nu}{\rho} \int \frac{d^{3}k}{(2\pi)^{3}} \int \frac{d\omega}{2\pi} \frac{1}{2} \left\{ \frac{k^{2}}{2m} + \omega \right\} \mathcal{A}(k, \omega) f(\omega)$$

The Koltun sumrule for the energy

* We need to calculate the total energy of the system:

$$E^{N} = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{H} | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$

* We have the Koltun sumrule to calculate the total energy of the system: first developed by Galitskii and Migdal (1958), later applied to finite system by Koltun ('70s)

$$\begin{split} \sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = & \left\{ \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 2 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle \\ \sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = & \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{E^{N} - E^{N+1}} dE \, E \frac{1}{\pi} \text{Im} \, G(\alpha, \alpha'; E) \\ \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{E^{N} - E^{N+1}} dE \, E \frac{1}{\pi} \text{Im} \, G(\alpha, \alpha'; E) \end{split} \right. \end{split}$$
The spectral function
$$\frac{E}{A} = \frac{\nu}{\rho} \int \frac{d^{3}k}{(2\pi)^{3}} \int \frac{d\omega}{2\pi} \frac{1}{2} \left\{ \frac{k^{2}}{2m} + \omega \right\} \mathcal{A}(k, \omega) f(\omega)$$

* We need to calculate the total energy of the system:

$$E^{N} = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{H} | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{W} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$

* How does the Koltun sumrule change with 3NF?

$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger} [a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 2 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 3 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{W} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$
$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger} [a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{E^{N} - E^{N-1}} dE E \frac{1}{\pi} \operatorname{Im} G(\alpha, \alpha'; E)$$

* We need to calculate the total energy of the system:

$$E^{N} = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{H} | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{W} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$

* How does the Koltun sumrule change with 3NF?

$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \left\langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 2 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 3 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{W} | \Psi^{N} \rangle \right.$$
$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \left\{ \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{E^{N} - E^{N-1}} \mathrm{d}E \, E \frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im} \, G(\alpha, \alpha'; E) \right\}$$

The spectral function

$$\frac{E}{A} = \frac{\nu}{\rho} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^3 k}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}\omega}{2\pi} \frac{1}{2} \left\{ \frac{k^2}{2m} + \omega - \frac{1}{3} \Sigma_{HF}^{3NF}(k) \right\} \mathcal{A}(k,\omega) f(\omega)$$

* We need to calculate the total energy of the system:

$$E^{N} = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{H} | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{W} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$

* How does the Koltun sumrule change with 3NF?

$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \left\{ \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 2 \rangle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 3 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{W} | \Psi^{N} \rangle \right\}$$

$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \left\{ \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{E^{N} - E^{N-1}} \mathrm{d}E E_{\pi}^{1} \mathrm{Im} \, G(\alpha, \alpha'; E) \right\}$$

$$\frac{E}{A} = \frac{\nu}{\rho} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^{3}k}{(2\pi)^{3}} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}\omega}{2\pi} \frac{1}{2} \left\{ \frac{k^{2}}{2m} + \omega - \frac{1}{3} \Sigma_{HF}^{3NF}(k) \right\} \mathcal{A}(k, \omega) f(\omega)$$

* We need to calculate the total energy of the system:

$$E^{N} = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{H} | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{W} | \Psi^{N} \rangle$$

* How does the Koltun sumrule change with 3NF?

$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \left\{ \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{T} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 2 \rangle \Psi^{N} | \hat{V} | \Psi^{N} \rangle + 3 \langle \Psi^{N} | \hat{W} | \Psi^{N} \rangle \right\}$$

$$\sum_{\alpha} \langle \Psi^{N} | a_{\alpha}^{\dagger}[a_{\alpha}, \hat{H}] | \Psi^{N} \rangle = \left\{ \sum_{\alpha} \int_{-\infty}^{E^{N-E^{N-1}}} dE E_{\pi}^{1} \operatorname{Im} G(\alpha, \alpha'; E) \right\}$$

$$\frac{E}{A} = \frac{\nu}{\rho} \int \frac{d^{3}k}{(2\pi)^{3}} \int \frac{d\omega}{2\pi} \frac{1}{2} \left\{ \frac{k^{2}}{2m} + \omega - \frac{1}{3} \Sigma_{HF}^{3NF}(k) \right\} \mathcal{A}(k, \omega) f(\omega)$$

$$\bigoplus -\bigoplus -\bigoplus$$



Thermodynamic consistency:



Outline:

- * Nuclear matter & the importance of adding three-nucleon forces (3NF)
- * Our approach to nuclear matter:
 - * the self-consistent Green's functions (SCGF) approach with 3NF
 - * include 3NF as a density dependent 2NF
- * Results
- Conclusions & Outlooks

- * Density dependent potentials obtained from:
 - * <u>Two-meson exchange potential</u> (Grangé *et al.* PRC 40, 1040 (1989)):

(* used in BHF calculations (Li <i>et al.</i> PRC	•
	77, 034316 (2008) , Vidaña <i>et al</i> . PRC 80,	
l	045806 (2009))	

 average accounts for correlations; not correctly included in many-body theory

* <u>UIX potential</u> (Pudliner *et al.* PRL 74, 4396 (1995)):

 used in FHNC calculations Lovato <i>et</i> <i>al.</i>, PRC 83, 054003 (2011) 	 average accounts for correlations on a statistical and dynamical level;
	correctly included in many-body theory

3NF as a density dependent 2NF....in SCGF

- Density dependent potentials obtained from:
 - * <u>UIX potential</u> (Pudliner *et al.* PRL 74, 4396 (1995):
 - used in SCGF calculations, Somá and Bozek, PRC 78, 054003 (2008)

average is performed with a dressed
SP propagator; not correctly included
in many-body theory



*

Arianna Carbone -- Nuclear matter with chiral three-nucleon forces -- 2nd April 2013, INT

- * Density dependent potentials obtained from:
 - * chiral N2LO 3NF potential:
 - * Holt *et al.* PRC 81, 024002, (2010);
 - * Hebeler *et al.* PRC 82, 014314 (2010);

 average is performed over the filled Fermi sea; correctly included in the many-body theory

* Li et al. PRC 85, 064002 (2012);	 average accounts for correlations; not
	correctly included in the many-body
	theory

- Our approach to include a 3NF as a density dependent 2NF:
 - Holt's definition of the density dependent 2NF, as detailed in Holt *et al.* PRC 81, 024002, 2010
 - Values of the low-energy constants c₁,c₃,c₄ fitted to NN and pi-N data (Entem & Machleidt PRC 68, 041001, 2003)
 - Values of low-energy constants which remain free, c_D and c_E, fitted to 3H and 4He g.s. (Navratil FBS 41, 117, 2007)



- Our approach to include a 3NF as a density dependent 2NF:
 - Holt's definition of the density dependent 2NF, as detailed in Holt *et al.* PRC 81, 024002, 2010
 - Values of the low-energy constants c₁,c₃,c₄ fitted to NN and pi-N data (Entem & Machleidt PRC 68, 041001, 2003)
 - Values of low-energy constants which remain free, c_D and c_E, fitted to 3H and 4He g.s. (Navratil FBS 41, 117, 2007)



- * Our approach to include a 3NF as a density dependent 2NF:
 - Holt's definition of the density dependent 2NF, as detailed in Holt *et al.* PRC 81, 024002, 2010
 - Values of the low-energy constants c₁,c₃,c₄ fitted to NN and pi-N data (Entem & Machleidt PRC 68, 041001, 2003)
 - Values of low-energy constants which remain free, c_D and c_E, fitted to 3H and 4He g.s. (Navratil FBS 41, 117, 2007)



- * Our approach to include a 3NF as a density dependent 2NF:
 - Holt's definition of the density dependent 2NF, as detailed in Holt *et al.* PRC 81, 024002, 2010
 - Values of the low-energy constants c₁,c₃,c₄ fitted to NN and pi-N data (Entem & Machleidt PRC 68, 041001, 2003)
 - Values of low-energy constants which remain free, c_D and c_E, fitted to 3H and 4He g.s. (Navratil FBS 41, 117, 2007)



Outline:

- * Nuclear matter & the importance of adding three-nucleon forces (3NF)
- * Our approach to nuclear matter:
 - * the self-consistent Green's functions (SCGF) approach with 3NF
 - include 3NF as a density dependent 2NF
- * <u>Results</u>
- Conclusions & Outlooks

* <u>Nuclear matter energy per nucleon</u> with the SCGF and BHF approach:



* <u>Nuclear matter energy per nucleon</u> with the BHF approach:



* Pin down thermal effects using the BHF approach:

Main effect at low density; T dependency is predictable and extrapolation to T=0 is under control

> Saturation values: density = 0.16 fm^{-3} energy = -11.25 MeV

Saturation values: density = 0.16 fm^{-3} energy = -12.30 MeV



* <u>Nuclear matter energy per nucleon</u>, comparison with curve obtained using SRG evolved N3LO 2B, with λ =2.0 fm⁻¹/ Λ_{3B} =2.5 fm⁻¹:



* Nuclear matter energy per nucleon, comparison with curve obtained using SRG evolved 2B N3LO with λ =2.0 fm⁻¹/ Λ_{3B} =2.0 fm⁻¹ by Hebeler *et al.* PRC 83, 031301 (2011):



Saturation values: density = 1.44 fm⁻¹ energy = -15.43 MeV

Saturation values: density = 1.35 fm^{-1} energy = -16.36 MeV

* <u>Momentum distribution</u> at finite temperature:



* <u>Spectral function</u> at finite temperature:



Arianna Carbone -- Nuclear matter with chiral three-nucleon forces -- 2nd April 2013, INT

Results: neutron matter

* <u>Neutron matter energy per nucleon</u> with the SCGF approach:



Outline:

- * Nuclear matter & the importance of adding three-nucleon forces (3NF)
- * Our approach to nuclear matter:
 - * the self-consistent Green's functions (SCGF) approach with 3NF
 - include 3NF as a density dependent 2NF
- Results
- * Conclusions & Outlooks

Conclusions & Outlooks

- We used the SCGF approach to calculate microscopic and macroscopic properties of symmetric nuclear matter
- We included 2B force up to N3LO and 3B up to N2LO in the density dependent prescription by J.W. Holt
- * We obtained consistent results for the saturation energy of nuclear matter, comparing also with the SRG evolved case
- * We also used the BHF approach and obtained realistic results with respect to other cases presented in the literature

Conclusions & Outlooks

- Perform average of N2LO 3NF with a dressed propagator; work is in progress at the moment
- Include missing 3NF diagrams
- * Improve correction of Koltun sumrule
- Evaluate neutron and asymmetric matter cases
- * Encounter a way to avoid pairing instability and perform calculations at T=0 MeV

Thank you for your attention!