Peering into the infrared with colored glass



Raju Venugopalan Brookhaven National Laboratory

INT program Symposium, Seattle, October 24, 2018

Outline of talk

- Gluon saturation leads to weakly coupled albeit strongly correlated glue in the Regge limit
- The CGC: a theory framework for gluon saturation
- Light from the CGC: the structure of higher order computations from a specific example
- **Color memory and the infrared circle**

The proton: a complex many-body system



A key lesson from the HERA DIS collider:

gluons and sea quarks dominate the proton wave-function at high energies

Boosting the proton uncovers many-body structure



Wee parton fluctuations time dilated on strong interaction time scales

Long lived gluons can radiate further small x gluons...

Is the proton a runaway popcorn machine at high energies ?

The runaway proton...



Nature does not like this!

The boosted proton viewed head-on Low Energy Gluon Density Grows $1/Q_{s}^{2}$ High Energy

When occupancies become large ~ $1/\alpha_s$, gluons resist further close packing -- recombining and screening their color charges -- leading to gluon saturation

Characterized by an emergent semi-hard scale $Q_s >> \Lambda_{QCD}$ in the Regge limit...

a weak coupling window into the infrared!

Saturation in the QCD landscape



Unique and controlled *dynamical* exploration of a fully nonlinear regime of quantum field theory

Saturation: dipole model formulation in DIS

$$\begin{split} & \gamma^{*} & \sum_{\mathbf{1}-\mathbf{z}} q \\ & \mathbf{q} \\ & \mathbf{q} \\ \sigma_{\mathrm{T,L}} = \int d^{2}r_{\perp} \int dz \, |\psi_{\mathrm{T,L}}(r_{\perp}, z, Q^{2})|^{2} \, \sigma_{q,\bar{q},P}(r_{\perp}, x) \\ & \mathbf{Golec-Biernat Wusthoff model} \\ & \sigma_{q\bar{q}P}(r_{\perp}, x) = \sigma_{0} \, \left[1 - \exp\left(-r_{\perp}^{2} \, Q_{s}^{2}(x)\right)\right] \, \mathbf{Q}_{s}^{2}(x) = Q_{0}^{2} \left(\frac{x_{0}}{x}\right)^{\lambda} \end{split}$$

Sophisticated dipole models give excellent fits to all HERA small x data

Parameters: $Q_0 = 1 \text{ GeV}; \lambda = 0.3;$ $x_0 = 3^* 10^{-4}; \sigma_0 = 23 \text{ mb}$

Saturation scale from dipole model fits to DIS data



Nonlinear response of saturated matter to probes



Varying both x and Q² essential to see nonlinear response of saturated gluons - a clear manifestation of the fully nonlinear character of QCD

For further discussion of some potentially striking systematics in DIS off nuclei, see e.g., Mantysaari and RV, PLB781 (2018) 664

Theory framework: the Color Glass Condensate



The nuclear wavefunction at high energies



evolution of wavefunction with energy

Effective Field Theory on Light Front





RG equations describe evolution of **W** with x

JIMWLK, BK

Inclusive DIS: dipole evolution



Inclusive DIS: dipole evolution



B-JIMWLK eqn. for dipole correlator

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial Y} \langle \operatorname{Tr}(V_x V_y^{\dagger}) \rangle_Y = -\frac{\alpha_S N_c}{2\pi^2} \int_{z_{\perp}} \frac{(x_{\perp} - y_{\perp})^2}{(x_{\perp} - z_{\perp})^2 (z_{\perp} - y_{\perp})^2} \left\langle \operatorname{Tr}(V_x V_y^{\dagger}) - \frac{1}{N_c} \operatorname{Tr}(V_x V_z^{\dagger}) \operatorname{Tr}(V_z V_y^{\dagger}) \right\rangle_Y$$

Dipole factorization:

$$\langle \operatorname{Tr}(V_x V_z^{\dagger}) \operatorname{Tr}(V_z V_y^{\dagger}) \rangle_Y \longrightarrow \langle \operatorname{Tr}(V_x V_z^{\dagger}) \rangle_Y \langle \operatorname{Tr}(V_z V_y^{\dagger}) \rangle_Y \qquad \mathsf{N_c} \twoheadrightarrow \mathsf{o}$$

Resulting closed form eqn. for a large nucleus is the Balitsky-Kovchegov eqn. Widely used in phenomenological applications

The BFKL equation is the low density $V \approx 1 - ig\rho/\nabla_t^2$ limit of the BK equation

CGC Effective Theory:B-JIMWLK hierarchy of many-body correlators



Diffusion of the fuzz of "wee" partons in the functional space of colored fields

Can be represented as a Langevin equation that can be solved numerically to "leading logs in x" accuracy.

Lighting up the CGC: Inclusive photon+dijet production



Right moving nucleus with momentum P_N^+ is Lorentz contracted in x^- direction

Glue fields satisfy Yang-Mills eqns.

 $[D_{\mu}, F^{\mu\nu}](x) = g\delta^{\nu+}\delta(x^{-})\rho_A(x_{\perp})$

 $A^{-,a} = 0$, $F_{ij}^{a} = 0$ with $A^{+,a}$, $A^{i,a}$ static (independent of x^{+})



Suppressed at small x

Inclusive photon+dijet production in DIS at LO

$$e(\tilde{l}) + A(P) \longrightarrow e(\tilde{l}') + Q(k) + \bar{Q}(p) + \gamma(k_{\gamma}) + X$$

Roy, RV; JHEP 1805 (2018) 013

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}\sigma}{\mathrm{d}x\mathrm{d}Q^2} = \frac{2\pi y^2}{64\pi^3 Q^2} \frac{\mathrm{d}^3\mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3 2E_k} \frac{\mathrm{d}^3\mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3 2E_p} \frac{\mathrm{d}^3\mathbf{k}_{\gamma}}{(2\pi)^3 2E_{k_{\gamma}}} \frac{1}{2q^-} \left(\frac{1}{2} \sum_{\mathrm{spins},\lambda} \left\langle |\tilde{\mathcal{M}}|^2 \right\rangle_{Y_A} \right) (2\pi)\delta(P^- - q^-)$$

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{\text{spins},\lambda} \langle |\tilde{\mathcal{M}}|^2 \rangle_{Y_A} = L_{\mu\nu} X^{\mu\nu}$$

$L_{\mu\nu}$ is well known-the lepton tensor

 $X^{\mu\nu}$ - the hadron tensor for inclusive photon +dijet production is what we compute



DIS inclusive cross-section at LO

Roy, RV; JHEP 1805 (2018) 013

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\mathrm{d}\sigma}{\mathrm{d}x\mathrm{d}Q^{2}\mathrm{d}^{2}\mathbf{k}_{\gamma\perp}\mathrm{d}\eta_{k_{\gamma}}} &= \frac{\alpha^{2}q_{f}^{4}y^{2}N_{c}}{512\pi^{5}Q^{2}}\frac{1}{2q^{-}}\int_{0}^{+\infty}\frac{\mathrm{d}k^{-}}{k^{-}}\int_{0}^{+\infty}\frac{\mathrm{d}p^{-}}{p^{-}}\int_{\mathbf{k}_{\perp},\mathbf{p}_{\perp}}L^{\mu\nu}\widetilde{X}_{\mu\nu}(2\pi)\delta(P^{-}-q^{-})\\ L^{\mu\nu} &= \frac{2e^{2}}{Q^{4}}\Big[\left(\tilde{l}^{\mu}\tilde{l}^{\prime\nu}+\tilde{l}^{\nu}\tilde{l}^{\prime\mu}\right)-\frac{Q^{2}}{2}g^{\mu\nu}\Big] & \text{includes Dirac trace}\\ \widetilde{X}_{\mu\nu} &= \int_{\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp},\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp},\mathbf{l}_{\perp},\mathbf{l}'_{\perp}}e^{-i(\mathbf{P}_{\perp}-\mathbf{l}_{\perp})\cdot\mathbf{x}_{\perp}-i\mathbf{l}_{\perp}\cdot\mathbf{y}_{\perp}+i(\mathbf{P}_{\perp}-\mathbf{l}'_{\perp})\cdot\mathbf{x}'_{\perp}+i\mathbf{l}'_{\perp}\cdot\mathbf{y}'_{\perp}} \int_{\tau_{\mu\nu}}^{+\eta}q\bar{q},q\bar{q}(\mathbf{l}_{\perp},\mathbf{l}'_{\perp}|\mathbf{P}_{\perp})\underbrace{\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp})}{\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp})} \underbrace{\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp})}{\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp})} \underbrace{\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp})}{\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp})}} \underbrace{\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp})}{\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp})}}$$

All the nonperturbative info about strongly correlated gluons is in

$$\Xi(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{x}'_{\perp},\mathbf{y}'_{\perp}) = 1 - D(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp}) - D(\mathbf{y}'_{\perp},\mathbf{x}'_{\perp}) + Q(\mathbf{x}_{\perp},\mathbf{y}_{\perp};\mathbf{y}'_{\perp},\mathbf{x}'_{\perp})$$

Dipoles: $D(x_{\perp}, y_{\perp}) = \frac{1}{N_c} \langle \operatorname{Tr} \left(\tilde{U}(x_{\perp}) \tilde{U}^{\dagger}(y_{\perp}) \right) \rangle_{Y_A}$

Quadrupoles: $Q(x_{\perp}, y_{\perp}) = \frac{1}{N_c} \langle \operatorname{Tr} \left(\tilde{U}(y'_{\perp}) \tilde{U}^{\dagger}(x'_{\perp}) \tilde{U}(x_{\perp}) \tilde{U}^{\dagger}(y_{\perp}) \right) \rangle_{Y_A}$



Interesting limits

When $k_v \rightarrow 0$, the amplitude satisfies the Low-Burnett-Kroll theorem:



Recover results in soft photon limit for di-jet production - sensitive to the gluon Weizsäcker-Williams distribution for large pair momenta

Dominguez, Marquet, Xiao, Yuan, PRD83 (2011) 105005

Recover in DIS kt-factorization & collinear factorization small x limits (sensitivity to leading twist gluon distribution)

Aurenche et al., Z. Phys. C24, 309 (1984)



Structure of higher order computations: Shockwave propagators

Convenient to work in the wrong light cone gauge $A^-=0$ for this problem (Gauge links in pdf definitions are unity in the right LC gauge $A^+=0$)

Dressed quark and gluon propagators: remarkably simple forms in A⁻=0 gauge

 $S(p,p') = (2\pi)^4 \delta^{(4)}(p-p') S_0(p) + S_0(p) \mathcal{T}(p,p') S_0(p')$ $G^{\mu\nu;ab}(p,p') = (2\pi)^4 \delta^{(4)}(p-p') G_0^{\mu\nu;ab} + G_0^{\mu\rho;ac} \mathcal{T}_{\rho\sigma;cd} G_0^{\sigma\nu;db}(p')$

McLerran, RV; hep-ph/9402335 Ayala,Jalilian-Marian,McLerran, RV; hep-ph/9508302 McLerran, RV; hep-ph/9809427 Balitsky, Belitsky, hep-ph/0110158

Structure of vertices identical to quark-quark-reggion and gluon-gluon-reggeon in Lipatov's Reggeon EFT

Bondarenko, Lipatov, Pozdynyakov, Prygarin, arXiv:1708.05183 Hentschinski, arXiv:1802.06755

$$j \xrightarrow{p} \swarrow^{p'} i$$

$$\mathcal{T}_{ij}(p,p') = (2\pi)\delta(p^- - p'^-)\gamma^- \operatorname{sign}(p^-) \int d^2 \mathbf{z}_{\perp} e^{i(\mathbf{p}_{\perp} - \mathbf{p}'_{\perp}) \cdot \mathbf{z}_{\perp}} \tilde{U}^{\operatorname{sign}(p^-)}(\mathbf{z}_{\perp})_{ij}$$

$$\mu; a \xrightarrow{p} \xrightarrow{p'} \mu; a \xrightarrow{p'} \nu; b$$

$$\mathcal{T}_{\mu\nu;ab}(p,p') = -2\pi\delta(p^- - p'^-) \times (2p^-)g_{\mu\nu} \operatorname{sign}(p^-) \int d^2 \mathbf{z}_{\perp} e^{i(\mathbf{p}_{\perp} - \mathbf{p}'_{\perp}) \cdot \mathbf{z}_{\perp}} U^{\operatorname{sign}(p^-)}_{ab}(\mathbf{z}_{\perp})$$

DIS inclusive photo+dijet production at NLO+NLLx



Roy, RV: in preparation

Formally NNLO: but collect NLO pieces in the photon+dijet impact factor + leading log pieces $\alpha_{\rm S} \log(\Lambda^{-}/\Lambda_{0}^{-})$

Formally NNLO: but collect LO pieces in the photon+dijet impact factor + NLL leading log pieces $\alpha_S^2 \log(\Lambda^{-}/\Lambda_0^{-})$

$$\langle \mathrm{d}\sigma_{NLO+NLLx} \rangle = \int [\mathcal{D}\rho_A] \left\{ W^{NLLx}[\rho_A] \,\mathrm{d}\hat{\sigma}_{LO}[\rho_A] + W^{LLx}[\rho_A] \,\mathrm{d}\hat{\sigma}_{NLO}[\rho_A] \right\}$$

$$= \int [\mathcal{D}\rho_A] \left(W^{NLLx}[\rho_A] \left\{ \mathrm{d}\hat{\sigma}_{LO}[\rho_A] + \mathrm{d}\hat{\sigma}_{NLO}[\rho_A] \right\} + O(\alpha_S^3 \ln(\Lambda_1^-/\Lambda_0^-)) \right)$$

$$\ln(\Lambda_1^-/\Lambda_0^-)(\mathcal{H}_{LO} + \mathcal{H}_{NLO})$$
NIO photon+dijet impact factor

Leading order JIMWLK Hamiltonian computed 20 years ago: 1997-2001 NLO JIMWLK Hamiltonian: 2013-2016

Balitsky, Chirilli, arXiv:1309.7644, Grabovsky, arXiv:1307.5414 Caron-Huot, arXiv:1309.6521, Kovner,Lublinsky,Mulian, arXiv:1310.0378, Lublinsky, Mulian, arXiv:1610.03453

The NLO inclusive photon impact factor

Several computations exist for inclusive DIS – subtleties

in choice of scheme, etc.

Balitsky,Chirilli, arXiv:1009.4729 Beuf, arXiv:1606.00777, 1708.06557 Hanninen, Lappi, Paatelainen, 1711.08207 Dijet: Boussarie, Grabovsky, Szymanowski, Wallon,1606.00419



Coda: A nontrivial derivation of JIMWLK evolution

coda : something that serves to round out, conclude, or summarize and usually has its own interest.

Roy, RV, in preparation

$$\text{Recall} \quad X^{\text{LO}}_{\mu\nu} = \mathcal{C}^{\text{LO}}_{\mu\nu} \otimes \Xi(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}, \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}; \boldsymbol{y}'_{\perp}, \boldsymbol{x}'_{\perp} | \Lambda^{-}_{0}) \qquad \Xi(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}, \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}; \boldsymbol{y}'_{\perp}, \boldsymbol{x}'_{\perp} | \Lambda^{-}_{0}) = 1 - D_{xy} - D_{y'x'} + Q_{y'x';xy}$$

In the "soft gluon limit" that generates logs in x, our NLO hadron tensor gives

$$\begin{split} X_{\mu\nu;LLx}^{\mathrm{NLO}} &= C_{\mu\nu}^{\mathrm{LO}} \otimes \ln(\Lambda_{1}^{-}/\Lambda_{0}^{-}) \left[\frac{\alpha_{S}N_{c}}{2\pi^{2}} \Big\{ \mathcal{K}_{B}(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{y}_{\perp};\boldsymbol{z}_{\perp}) D_{xy} + \begin{pmatrix} \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}' \\ \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}' \end{pmatrix} \Big\} - \frac{\alpha_{S}N_{c}}{(2\pi)^{2}} \mathcal{K}_{1}(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{y}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}',\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}';\boldsymbol{z}_{\perp}) Q_{xy;y'x'} \\ &- \frac{\alpha_{S}N_{c}}{2\pi^{2}} \Big\{ \mathcal{K}_{B}(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{y}_{\perp};\boldsymbol{z}_{\perp}) D_{xz}D_{zy} + \begin{pmatrix} \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}' \\ \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}' \end{pmatrix} \Big\} + \frac{\alpha_{S}N_{c}}{(2\pi)^{2}} \left(\Big\{ \mathcal{A}(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}',\boldsymbol{y}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}';\boldsymbol{z}_{\perp}) D_{xx'}D_{y'y} + \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp} \leftrightarrow \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}' \Big\} \\ &+ \Big\{ \mathcal{K}_{2}(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{y}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}';\boldsymbol{z}_{\perp}) D_{xz}Q_{zy;y'x'} + \begin{pmatrix} \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}' \\ \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}' \end{pmatrix} \Big\} + \Big\{ \mathcal{K}_{2}(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}',\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp},\boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}';\boldsymbol{z}_{\perp}) D_{zx'}Q_{y'z;xy'} + \begin{pmatrix} \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}' \\ \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}' \end{pmatrix} \Big\} \Big\} \end{split}$$

Nontrivial combinations of dipole and quadrupole operators

Dominguez, Mueller, Munier, Xiao, PLB705(2011)106

Remarkably, this can be reexpressed as $X_{\mu\nu;LLx}^{\text{NLO}} = C_{\mu\nu}^{\text{LO}} \otimes \ln\left(\frac{\Lambda_1^-}{\Lambda_0^-}\right) H_{\text{JIMWLK}}^{\text{LO}} \Xi(\boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}, \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}; \boldsymbol{y}_{\perp}', \boldsymbol{x}_{\perp}' | \Lambda_0^-)$

This immediately leads to the JIMWLK RG equation for the rapidity evolution of many-body gluon correlators

$$W_{\Lambda_1^-}[\rho_A] = \left(1 + \ln\left(\frac{\Lambda_1^-}{\Lambda_0^-}\right) H_{\text{JIMWLK}}^{\text{LO}}\right) W_{\Lambda_0^-}[\rho_A]$$

Color Memory in the CGC

Ball,Pate,Raclariu,Strominger,RV, arXiv:0805.12224

2007

000000

$$A_i = 0 \qquad A_i = -\frac{-1}{ig} \cup \partial_i U^{\dagger}$$
$$x^- = 0$$

In the CGC, the solutions of the YM-eqns can be represented as two pure gauges separated by a discontinuity at $x^{-}=0$ corresponding to the shockwave and A_{i} satisfies

$$D_i \frac{dA^{i,a}}{dy} = g\rho^a(x_t, y) \quad \text{with } y=\text{Ln}(x^-/x_0^-)$$

ith the solution
$$U = P \exp(i \int_y^\infty dy' \frac{\rho(x_t, y')}{\nabla_t^2})$$

This U is precisely the *color memory* effect corresponding to a color – rotation and $p_T \sim Q_S$ kick experienced by a quark-antiquark pair traversing the shock wave – discussed previously as a property of YM fields by Pate, Raclariu and Strominger (1707.08016)

Its presence is ubiquitous in DIS final states

W



Conjectured to be very general property of the infrared in gauge theories & gravity In gravity, the symmetries are the BMS symmetry and the corresponding gravitational memory leads to a physical displacement of inertial detectors measurable by LIGO



In QED, these correspond to a symmetry group of an infinite number of conserved charges at $x^- = \pm \infty$ on the celestial sphere (stereographic projection of transverse plane) and these satisfy a conservation law with the S-matrix

$$\langle \operatorname{out} | (Q_{\varepsilon}^{+} \mathcal{S} - \mathcal{S} Q_{\varepsilon}^{-}) | \operatorname{in} \rangle = 0$$

This is equivalent to the soft photon theorem and also imposes a condition that the S-matrix be dressed by a soft factor that renders it infrared finite



Equivalent to Faddeev-Kulish (!970) coherent state representation of S-matrix Kapec,Perry,Raclariu,Strominger,arXiv:1705.043011 On light front, for FK rep. see More, Misra, 1206.3097

Bold conjecture: QCD in the infrared



Thank you for your attention!

Classical field of a large nucleus



letermined from RG evolution

The NLO inclusive photon impact factor

Inclusive photon cross-section: NLO-real * NLO*real + LO * NLO virtual

Wilson line factor	Real emission	Virtual: Vertex	Virtual: Self-energy
$\frac{N_c^2}{2} \Big(1 - D_{xz} D_{zy} - D_{y'z} D_{zx'} + $	$T_R^{(1)*}T_R^{(1)}$		
$D_{y^\prime y} D_{xx^\prime} \Big) - rac{1}{2} \Xi(x_\perp,y_\perp;y_\perp^\prime,x_\perp^\prime)$			
$C_F N_c \Xi(oldsymbol{x}_\perp,oldsymbol{y}_\perp;oldsymbol{y}_\perp',oldsymbol{x}_\perp')$	$T_R^{(2)*}T_R^{(2)} + T_R^{(3)*}T_R^{(3)}$	$T_{LO}^* T_V^{(3)} + c.c$	$T_{LO}^*T_S^{(3)} + c.c$
$\frac{N_c^2}{2}[(1 - D_{xy})(1 - D_{y'x'})] -$	$T_R^{(2)*}T_R^{(3)} + c.c$	$T_{LO}^* T_V^{(4)} + c.c$	
$rac{1}{2}\Xi(x_{\perp},y_{\perp};y_{\perp}',x_{\perp}')$			
$\frac{N_c^2}{2} \left(1 + (Q_{zy;y'x'} - D_{zy}) D_{xz} - \right)$	$T_R^{(2)*}T_R^{(1)}$	$T_{LO}^* T_V^{(1)}$	$T_{LO}^* T_S^{(1)}$
$D_{y'x'}\Big) - rac{1}{2} \Xi(x_\perp,y_\perp;y'_\perp,x'_\perp)$			
$\frac{N_c^2}{2} \left(1 + (Q_{xy;y'z} - D_{y'z})D_{zx'} - \right) \right)$	$T_R^{(1)*}T_R^{(2)}$	$T_V^{(1)*} T_{LO}$	$T_{S}^{(1)*}T_{LO}$
$D_{xy} \Big) - rac{1}{2} \Xi(x_\perp,y_\perp;y'_\perp,x'_\perp)$			
$\frac{N_c^2}{2} \Big(1 + (Q_{y'x';xz} - D_{xz})D_{zy} - $	$T_R^{(3)}{}^*T_R^{(1)}$	$T_{LO}^* T_V^{(2)}$	$T_{LO}^* T_S^{(2)}$
$D_{y'x'}\Big) - rac{1}{2} \Xi(x_\perp,y_\perp;y'_\perp,x'_\perp)$			
$\frac{N_c^2}{2} \left(1 + (Q_{xy;zx'} - D_{zx'})D_{y'z} - \right)$	$T_R^{(1)*}T_R^{(3)}$	$T_V^{(2)*} T_{LO}$	$T_{S}^{(2)*}T_{LO}$
$D_{xy} ight) - rac{1}{2} \Xi(x_ot, y_ot; y_ot, x_ot)$			

For each Wilson line structure, collinear divergences cancel between real and Interference contributions

Rapidity and UV divergent pieces: these can be absorbed, in a subtraction scheme, into the NLLx JIMWLK expressions.