Nucleon and Pion Structure at Low and High Momenta.

David Richards Jefferson Laboratory

9th October 2017 INT, Seattle







Introduction

- Measures of Hadron Structure and Lattice QCD
- Nucleon Charges and the role of excited states
- Exploring structure at long distances coordinatespace methods
- Hadron structure at high momentum transfer Pion Form Factor
- Summary





Lattice QCD

Observables in lattice QCD are then expressed in terms of the path integral as

$$\begin{split} \langle \mathcal{O} \rangle &= \frac{1}{Z} \prod_{n,\mu} dU_{\mu}(n) \prod_{n} d\psi(n) \prod_{n} d\bar{\psi}(n) \mathcal{O}(U,\psi,\bar{\psi}) e^{-\left(S_{G}[U] + S_{F}[U,\psi,\bar{\psi}]\right)} \\ \text{Integrate out the Grassmann variables:} \\ \langle \mathcal{O} \rangle &= \frac{1}{Z} \prod_{n,\mu} dU_{\mu}(n) \mathcal{O}(U,G[U]) \det M[U] e^{-S_{G}[U]} \qquad \text{Importance Sampling} \\ \text{where } G(U,x,y)_{\alpha\beta}^{ij} \equiv \langle \psi_{\alpha}^{i}(x)\bar{\psi}_{\beta}^{j}(y) \rangle = M^{-1}(U) \end{split}$$

- Generate an ensemble of gauge configurations $P[U] \propto \det M[U] e^{-S_G[U]}$
- Calculate observable

$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^{N} \mathcal{O}(U^n, G[U^n])$$





Hadron Structure



 $C_{3\text{pt}}(t_{sep}, t; \vec{p}, \vec{q}) = \sum_{\vec{x}, \vec{y}} \langle 0 \mid N(\vec{x}, t_{sep}) V_{\mu}(\vec{y}, t) \bar{N}(\vec{0}, 0) \mid 0 \rangle e^{-i\vec{p} \cdot \vec{x}} e^{-i\vec{q} \cdot \vec{y}}$

Resolution of unity - insert states

 $\longrightarrow \langle 0 \mid N \mid N, \vec{p} + \vec{q} \rangle \langle N, \vec{p} + \vec{q} \mid V_{\mu} \mid N\vec{p} \rangle \langle N, \vec{p} \mid \bar{N} \mid 0 \rangle e^{-E(\vec{p} + \vec{q})(t_{\rm sep} - t)} e^{-E(\vec{p})t}$





PRECISION ISOVECTOR NUCLEON STRUCTURE





Hadron Structure



M Constantinou, arXiv:1511.00214

- Governs beta-decay rate
- Important for proton-proton fusion rate in solar models
- Benchmark for lattice QCD calculations of hadron structure

e.g. novel interactions probed in ultracold neutron decay







Calculation of Physics Observables

Our paradigm: nucleon mass
$$C(t) = \sum_{\vec{x}} \langle N(\vec{x}, t) \bar{N}(0) \rangle = \sum_{n} |A_n|^2 e^{-E_n t}$$

Noise:
$$C_{\sigma^2}(t) = \sum_{\vec{x}} \langle \bar{N}N(\vec{x},t)\bar{N}N(0) \rangle \longrightarrow e^{-3m_{\pi}t}$$

whence $\frac{\vec{x}}{C(t)/\sqrt{C_{\sigma^2}(t)}} \simeq e^{-(m_N - 3m_{\pi}/2)t}$

Use local nucleon interpolating operators

$$[uC\gamma_5(1\pm\gamma_4)d]u$$

Replace quark field by spatially extended (smeared) quark field

$$\psi \longrightarrow (1 - \sigma^2 \nabla^2 / 4N)^N \psi$$





Variational Method

Subleading terms → *Excited* states

Construct matrix of correlators: *different smearing radii*

$$C_{ij}(t) = \sum_{\vec{x}} \langle N_i(\vec{x}, t) \bar{N}_j(0) \rangle = \sum_n A_n^i A_n^{j\dagger} e^{-E_n t}$$

Delineate contributions using *variational method*: solve

$$C(t)v^{(N)}(t,t_0) = \lambda_N(t,t_0)C(t_0)v^{(N)}(t,t_0).$$

$$\lambda_N(t, t_0) \to e^{-E_N(t-t_0)} (1 + \mathcal{O}(e^{-\Delta E(t-t_0)}))$$

Eigenvectors, with metric $C(t_0)$, are orthonormal and project onto the respective states

$$v^{(N')\dagger}C(t_0)v^{(N)} = \delta_{N,N}$$





Systematic Uncertainties

Yoon et al., Phys. Rev. D 93, 114506 (2016)

Failure to isolating ground state leads to important systematic uncertainty.







Renormalized Charges





Feynman-Hellman Method



Berkowitz et al, arXiv:1704.01114

Calculation using Feynman-Hellman Theory

$$H = H_0 + \lambda H_\lambda$$
$$\frac{\partial E_n}{\partial \lambda} = \langle n \mid H_\lambda \mid n \rangle$$

Reduces to calculation of energy-shift of two-point functions *but* repeat the calculation for each operator





Sea Quark Contributions







EM Form factors at Low and High Momenta







Isgur-Wise Function and CKM matrix



UKQCD, L. Lellouch et al., Nucl. Phys. B444, 401 (1995), hep-lat/9410013





Moment Methods



- Introduce three-momentum projected three-point function $C^{3\text{pt}}(t,t') = \sum_{\vec{x},\vec{x}'} \left\langle N^a_{t,\vec{x}} \Gamma_{t',\vec{x}'} \overline{N}^b_{0,\vec{0}} \right\rangle e^{-ikx'_z}$
- Now take derivative w.r.t. k²

whence
$$C'_{3\text{pt}}(t,t') = \sum_{\vec{x},\vec{x'}} \frac{-x'_{z}}{2k} \sin(kx'_{z}) \left\langle N^{a}_{t,\vec{x}} \Gamma_{t',\vec{x'}} \overline{N}^{b}_{0,\vec{0}} \right\rangle$$
$$\lim_{k^{2} \to 0} C'_{3\text{pt}}(t,t') = \sum_{\vec{x},\vec{x'}} \frac{-x'^{2}_{z}}{2} \left\langle N^{a}_{t,\vec{x}} \Gamma_{t',\vec{x'}} \overline{N}^{b}_{0,\vec{0}} \right\rangle.$$

Odd moments vanish by symmetry





Lattice Details

• Two degenerate light-quark flavors, and strange quark set to its physical value

a	\simeq	$0.12~\mathrm{fm}$
m_{π}	\simeq	$400 { m MeV}$
Lattice Size	:	$24^3 \times 64$

• To gain control over finite-volume effects, replicate in z direction: $24 \times 24 \times 48 \times 64$





Three-point correlator



- Spatial moments push the peak of the correlator away from origin
- Larger finite volume corrections compared to regular correlators

Jefferson Lab



Fitting the data...

$$C^{3\text{pt}}(t,t') = \sum_{n,m} \frac{Z_n^{\dagger a}(0)\Gamma_{nm}(k^2)Z_m^b(k^2)}{4M_n(0)E_m(k^2)} e^{-M_n(0)(t-t')}e^{-E_m(k^2)t'}$$

$$C_{2\text{pt}}(t) = \sum_m \frac{Z_m^{b\dagger}(k^2)Z_m^b(k^2)}{2E_m(k^2)}e^{-E_m(k^2)t}$$
where
$$Z_n^{\dagger a}(0) \equiv \langle \Omega | N^a | n, p_i = (0,0,0) \rangle$$

$$Z_m^b(k^2) \equiv \langle n, p_i = (0,0,k) | \overline{N}^b | \Omega \rangle$$

$$\Gamma_{nm}(k^2) \equiv \langle n, p_i = (0,0,0) | \Gamma | m, p_i = (0,0,k) \rangle$$

Allow for multi-state contributions in the fit





Fitting - III







F₁ Form Factor







Pion Structure

Raul Briceno, Bipasha Chakraborty, Adithia Kusno, DGR





Pion Structure







Variational Method Revisited

$$\begin{split} C_{2\mathrm{pt}}(t,\vec{p}) &= \sum_{\vec{x}} \langle \phi(\vec{x},t)\phi^{\dagger}(0) \rangle e^{-i\vec{p}\cdot\vec{x}} \\ \text{Signal-to-noise ratio:} \quad C_{2\mathrm{pt}}(t,\vec{p})/C_{\sigma^{2}}(t) \longrightarrow e^{-((E(\vec{p})-m_{\pi})t))} \\ \text{Construct matrix of correlators with judicious choice of operators} \\ C_{ij}(t) &= \frac{1}{V_{3}} \sum_{\vec{x},\vec{y}} \langle \phi_{i}(\vec{x},t)\phi^{\dagger}_{j}(\vec{y},0) \rangle = \sum_{N} A_{N}^{i}A_{N}^{j\dagger}e^{-E_{N}t} \\ \text{Delineate contributions using variational method: solve} \\ C(t)v^{(N)}(t,t_{0}) &= \lambda_{N}(t,t_{0})C(t_{0})v^{(N)}(t,t_{0}). \\ \lambda_{N}(t,t_{0}) \rightarrow e^{-E_{N}(t-t_{0})}(1+\mathcal{O}(e^{-\Delta E(t-t_{0})})) \end{split}$$

Eigenvectors, with metric $C(t_0)$, are orthonormal and project onto the respective states

$$v^{(N')\dagger}C(t_0)v^{(N)} = \delta_{N,N'}$$
$$Z_i^N = \sqrt{2m_N}e^{m_N t_0/2}v_j^{(N)*}C_{ji}(t_0).$$





Variational Method: Meson Operators

Aim: interpolating operators of *definite* (continuum) JM: \bigcirc JM $\langle 0 \mid O^{JM} \mid J', M' \rangle = Z^J \delta_{J,J'} \delta_{M,M'}$ Starting point $\bar{\psi}(\vec{x},t) \Gamma D_i D_j \dots \psi(\vec{x},t)$ Introduce circular basis: $\overleftrightarrow{D}_{m=-1} = \frac{i}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\overleftrightarrow{D}_x - i \overleftrightarrow{D}_y \right)$ $\overleftrightarrow{D}_{m=0} = i \overleftrightarrow{D}_z$ $\overleftrightarrow{D}_{m=+1} = -\frac{i}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\overleftrightarrow{D}_x + i \overleftrightarrow{D}_y \right).$

Straighforward to project to definite spin - for example J = 0, 1, 2

$$(\Gamma \times D_{J=1}^{[1]})^{J,M} = \sum_{m_1,m_2} \langle 1, m_1; 1, m_2 | J, M \rangle \,\overline{\psi} \Gamma_{m_1} \overleftrightarrow{D}_{m_2} \psi.$$

Caveat: rotational symmetry not a good symmetry of the lattice *but realized in practice for operators of "hadronic size"*





Meson Operators - II

Thomas et al., Phys. Rev. D 85, 014507 (2012) FINAL STEP: Project to lattice irrep

Lattice	Little Group	Irreps ($\Lambda \text{ or } \Lambda^{p}$)
Momentum	(double cover)	(for single cover)
(0,0,0)	O _h ^D	$A_1^{\pm}, A_2^{\pm}, E^{\pm}, T_1^{\pm}, T_2^{\pm}$
(n, 0, 0)	Dic ₄	A_1, A_2, B_1, B_2, E_2
(n, n, 0)	Dic ₂	A_1, A_2, B_1, B_2
(n, n, n)	Dic ₃	A_1, A_2, E_2
(n, m, 0)	C4	A_1, A_2
(n, n, m)	C4	A_1, A_2
(n, m, p)	C2	Α

...Minimize number of excited energies in lattice irrep





Distillation

M. Peardon et al., PRD80,054506 (2009)

Can we evaluate such a matrix efficiently, for reasonable basis of operators?

Introduce $\tilde{\psi}(\vec{x},t) = L(\vec{x},\vec{y})\psi(\vec{y},t)$ where L is 3D Laplacian Write $L \equiv (1 - \kappa \nabla/n)^n = \sum f(\lambda_i)\xi^i \times \xi^{*i}$ where λ_i and ξ_i are eigenvalues and eigenvectors of the Laplacian. We now truncate the expansion sufficiently to capture low-energy physics Insert between each quark field in our correlation function.

Perambulators $\tau^{ij}_{\alpha\beta}(t,0) = \xi^{*i}(t)M^{-1}(t,0)_{\alpha\beta}\xi^{j}$

$$C_{ij}(t) = \phi_i^{pq}(t)\phi_j^{rs} \times \tau^{pr}(t,0)\tau^{qs\dagger}(t,0)$$

• 3pt functions implemented by replacing one of the perambulators by a so-called generalized perambulator with current inserted.

$$S^{ij}(t_f, t, t_i) = \xi^{(i)\dagger}(t_f) M^{-1}(t_f, t) \Gamma(t) M^{-1}(t, t_i) \xi^{(j)}(t_i)$$





Distillation for Pion FF

 Formalism for EM matrix elements already demonstrated for mesons by HadSpec collaboration.







Distillation for Pion FF - II







Anisotropic Lattices







Charge Radius







Form Factor at High Momentum







High Momentum - II



Momentum-smearing, at strange-quark masses

Koponen et al (HPQCD), PRD96, 054501 (2017)







Quark Distribution Amplitude

Leading-twist EM form factor at high momentum governed by Quark Distribution Amplitude

$$\phi_{\pi}(x) = \frac{i}{f_{\pi}} \int \frac{d\xi}{2\pi} e^{i(x-1)\xi\lambda \cdot P} \langle \pi(P) \mid \bar{\psi}(0)\lambda \cdot \gamma\gamma_{5}\Gamma(0,\xi\lambda\psi(\xi\lambda)\mid 0 > - Generalized Parton Distributions (off-forward): GPDs - PDFs$$

- (Transverse-Momentum-Dependent Distributions): TMDs
- Euclidean lattice precludes the calculation of light-cone correlation functions
 - So....Use Operator-Product-Expansion to formulate in terms of local operators

$$\mathcal{O}^{\mu_1\dots\mu_n} = i^{n-1} \bar{\psi} \gamma_5 \gamma^{\{\mu_1} D^{\mu_2} \dots D^{\mu_n\}} \frac{\lambda^u}{2} \psi$$

 Discretisation, and hence reduced symmetry of the lattice, introduces power-divergent mixing for N >3 moment.





QDA - II

- Lowest moment: f_{π}
- 1st moment: vanishes
- 2nd Moment: only constraint...

Martinelli, Sachrajda (87), Daniel, Gupta, Richards (91),...,Braun et al (2015)







Quasi Distributions

A solution, LaMET (Large Momentum Effective Theory) was proposed by X.Ji
 X. Ji, Phys. Rev. Lett. 110 (2013) 262002

$$\tilde{\phi}(x,P) = \frac{i}{f_{\pi}} \int \frac{dz}{2\pi} e^{-i(x-1)Pz} \langle \pi(P) \mid \bar{\psi}(0)\gamma^{z}\gamma_{5}\Gamma(0,z)\psi(z) \mid 0 \rangle$$
$$\tilde{\phi}(x,\Lambda,P) = \int_{0}^{1} dy \, Z(x,y,\Lambda,\mu,P)\phi(y,\mu) + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{\Lambda_{\text{QCD}}^{2}}{P^{2}},\frac{m_{\pi}^{2}}{P^{2}}\right)$$

Y-Q Ma and J-W Qiu, arXiv:1404.6860, arXiv:1709.03018

Matching and evolution of quasi- and light-cone distributions

Carlson, Freid, arXiv:1702.05775 Isikawa et al., arXiv:1609.02018 Monahan and Orginos, arXiv:1612.01584 Orginos, Radyushkin , et al arXiv:1706.05373 (**Pseudo Distributions**) Briceno, Hansen, Monahan, arXiv:1703.06072 (Euclidean Signature)





Energy-Momentum Tensor?



Trace Anomaly: $T_{\mu\mu} = -(1+\gamma_m)\bar{\psi}\psi + \frac{\beta(g)}{2g}G^2$ $T_{\mu\nu} = \frac{1}{4}\bar{\psi}\gamma_{(\mu}D_{\nu)}\psi + G_{\mu\alpha}G_{\nu\alpha} - \frac{1}{4}\delta_{\mu\nu}G^2; \langle P \mid T_{\mu\nu} \mid P \rangle = P_{\mu}P_{\nu}/M$

Briceno, Hansen and Walker-Loud, PRD 91, 034501 (2015)

Yang, this meeting





Baryon Operators

 $\langle 0 \mid O^{JM} \mid J', M' \rangle = Z^J \delta_{J,J'} \delta_{M,M'}$ Starting point $B = (\mathcal{F}_{\Sigma_F} \otimes \mathcal{S}_{\Sigma_S} \otimes \mathcal{D}_{\Sigma_D}) \{ \psi_1 \psi_2 \psi_3 \}$ Introduce circular basis: $\overleftarrow{D}_{m=-1} = \frac{i}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\overleftarrow{D}_x - i \overleftarrow{D}_y \right)$ $\overleftarrow{D}_{m=0} = i \overleftarrow{D}_z$ $\overleftarrow{D}_{m=+1} = -\frac{i}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\overleftarrow{D}_x + i \overleftarrow{D}_y \right).$ Straighforward to project to definite spin: J = 1/2, 3/2, 5/2 $|[J,M]\rangle = \sum |[J_1, m_1]\rangle \otimes |[J_2, m_2]\rangle \langle J_1 m_1; J_2 m_2 | JM \rangle$

 m_1, m_2

 $D_{J=1}^{[2]}$ is the *signature* of hybrid baryon





Distillation for Baryons?

 $\begin{array}{ll} \text{Measure matrix of correlation functions:} & C_{ij}(t) \equiv \sum_{\vec{x},\vec{y}} \langle N_i(\vec{x},t)\bar{N}_j(\vec{y},0) \rangle \\ \text{M. Peardon et al., PRD80,054506 (2009)} & Perambulators & \tau^{ij}_{\alpha\beta}(t,0) = \xi^{*i}(t)M^{-1}(t,0)_{\alpha\beta}\xi^j \\ \text{Perambulators} & \tau^{ij}_{\alpha\beta\gamma}(t,0) = \xi^{*i}(t)M^{-1}(t,0)_{\alpha\beta}\xi^j \\ C_{ij}(t) = \phi^{i,(pqr)}_{\alpha\beta\gamma}(t)\phi^{j,(\bar{p}\bar{q}\bar{r})}_{\bar{\alpha}\bar{\beta}\bar{\gamma}}(0) \times \left[\tau^{p\bar{p}}_{\alpha\bar{\alpha}}(t,0)\tau^{q\bar{q}}_{\beta\bar{\beta}}(t,0)\tau^{r\bar{r}}_{\gamma\bar{\gamma}}(t,0) + \dots\right] \end{array}$

- Meson correlation functions N³
- Baryon correlation functions N⁴

Severely constrains baryon lattice sizes





Excited Baryon Spectrum







Nucleon Dispersion Relation





Thomas Jefferson National Accelerator Facility



Isotropic Clover Production

ID	m_l	β	a (fm)	$M_{\pi} ({\rm MeV})$	L	T	$M_{\pi}L$	Split at	N_{traj}	On Titan
C12	-0.2800	6.1	0.118	430	48	96	12.4		20000	
C13	-0.2850	6.1	0.114	300	32	96	5.6			1762 - 2104
C13a	-0.2850	6.1	0.114	300	32	96	5.6			1100 - 1870
C13b	-0.2850	6.1	0.114	300	32	96	5.6			1000 - 2618
C13-W	-0.2850	6.1	0.114	300	32	96	5.6			2108 - 3164
C13a-W	-0.2850	6.1	0.114	300	32	96	5.6			1872 - 3564
C13b-W	-0.2850	6.1	0.114	300	32	96	5.6			2620 - 3980
D4	-0.2350	6.3	0.085	400	32	64	5.5		5164	
D5	-0.2390	6.3	0.081	310	32	64	4.0		6020	1000 - 6020
D6	-0.2416	6.3	0.080	210	48	96	3.7		2312 (a)	1000 - 2312
D6a	-0.2416	6.3	0.080	210	48	96	3.7	1000	866~(a)	254 - 866
D6b	-0.2416	6.3	0.080	210	48	96	3.7	1200	956~(a)	284 - 956
D7	-0.2416	6.3	0.080	210	64	128	4.9		1514 (a)	1112 - 1514
D7b	-0.2416	6.3	0.080	210	64	128	4.9	700	640 (a)	330 - 640
D7c	-0.2416	6.3	0.080	210	64	128	4.9	750	732 (a)	288 - 592
D7d	-0.2416	6.3	0.080	210	64	128	4.9	800	762~(a)	328 - 736
D8	-0.2424	6.3	0.080	140	72	196	4.1		370 (b)	

Add third lattice spacing: β = 6.5, a ~0.06





SUMMARY

- Controlling systematic uncertainties key at both low momenta and high momenta
- Pion is an important theatre to test our ideas, and in particular key measure of transition from "soft" to "hard" degrees of freedom in QCD
- Simplest, and computationally least demanding, hadron for lattice structure calculations
- Self-contained confrontation for direct calculation of wave function, and twist expansion in lattice QCD?
- Operators and methods for quark distribution amplitudes provide exploratory theatre for studies of PDFs and GPDs in the nucleon.
- Can we get to high momenta?





Proton EM form factors

 Nucleon Pauli and Dirac Form Factors described in terms of matrix element of vector current

 $\langle N \mid V_{\mu} \mid N \rangle(\vec{q}) = \bar{u}(\vec{p}_f) \left[F_q(q^2)\gamma_{\mu} + \sigma_{\mu\nu}q_{\nu}\frac{F_2(q^2)}{2m_N} \right] u(\vec{p}_i)$

• Alternatively, Sach's form factors determined in experiment $G_E(Q^2) = F_1(Q^2) - \frac{Q^2}{4M^2}F_2(Q^2)$ $G_M(Q^2) = F_1(Q^2) + F_2(Q^2)$

Charge radius is slope at $Q^2 = 0$

$$\frac{\partial G_E(Q^2)}{\partial Q^2}\Big|_{Q^2=0} = -\frac{1}{6}\langle r^2 \rangle = \left.\frac{\partial F_1(Q^2)}{\partial Q^2}\right|_{Q^2=0} - \frac{F_2(0)}{4M^2}$$





1D Structure: EM Form Factors

