

Canada's national laboratory for particle and nuclear physics Laboratoire national canadien pour la recherche en physique nucléaire et en physique des particules

Predictive Power of Chiral Interactions for Nuclear Structure and Reaction Calculations in the p-Shell

INT Program INT-17-1a March 27 2017, Seattle



Owned and operated as a joint venture by a consortium of Canadian universities via a contribution through the National Research Council Canada Propriété d'un consortium d'universités canadiennes, géré en co-entreprise à partir d'une contribution administrée par le Conseil national de recherches Canada

Angelo Calci | TRIUMF



Outline





Outline

ab initio description of nuclei

QCD-based interaction

realistic NN+3N interactions





Chiral NN+3N Interactions

Weinberg, van Kolck, Machleidt, Entem, Meissner, Epelbaum, Krebs, Bernard,...

• standard interaction:

- NN @ N³LO: Entem & Machleidt, 500MeV cutoff
- 3N @ N²LO: Navrátil, local, 500MeV cutoffs & modifications of the 3N force

• optimized N²LO interaction:

- NN: Ekström et al., 500MeV cutoff, LECs fitted with $(Q/\Lambda_{\chi})^3$ POUNDerS
- 3N: Navrátil, local, 500MeV cutoff, fit to ⁴He & Triton

• EGM N²LO interaction:

- NN: Epelbaum et al., 450, ..., 600 MeV cutoff
- 3N: Epelbaum et al., 450, . . . , 600 MeV cutoff, nonlocal





Weinberg, van Kolck, Machleidt, Entem, Meissner, Epelbaum, Krebs, Bernard,...



standard interaction:

- NN @ N³LO: Entem & Machleidt, 500MeV cutoff
- 3N @ N²LO: Navrátil, local, 500MeV cutoffs & modifications of the 3N force

chiral interactions are not unique:

- chiral order
- regularization
- fit of low-energy constants (LECs)
- (power counting)
- NN: Epelbaum et al., 450, ..., 600 MeV cutoff
- 3N: Epelbaum et al., 450, ..., 600 MeV cutoff, nonlocal

RIUMF



Next Generation Interactions

Weinberg, van Kolck, Machleidt, Entem, Meissner, Epelbaum, Krebs, Bernard,...

standard interaction:

- NN @ N³LO: Entem & Machleidt, 500MeV cutoff
- 3N @ N²LO: Navrátil, local cutoffs

• N²LO_{SAT} interaction:

 NN+3N: Ekström et al., nonlocal 450MeV cutoff, simultaneous fit to NN data and selected many-body observables

• LENPIC interaction:

- NN up to N⁴LO: Epelbaum et al., semi-local cutoff
- 3N up to N³LO: under construction
- N⁴LO(500):
 - NN @ N⁴LO: Machleidt et al., 500MeV cutoff



with respect to the many-body basis

unitary transformation leads to evolution equation

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}\alpha}\widetilde{\mathrm{H}}_{\alpha} = \left[\eta_{\alpha}, \widetilde{\mathrm{H}}_{\alpha}\right] \quad \text{with} \quad \eta_{\alpha} = (2\mu)^{2}\left[\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{int}}, \widetilde{\mathrm{H}}_{\alpha}\right] = -\eta_{\alpha}^{\dagger}$$

advantages of SRG: **flexibility** and **simplicity**





Outline



• solving the eigenvalue problem:

 $\mathsf{H} \left| \Psi_n \right\rangle = E_n \left| \Psi_n \right\rangle$

• model space:

spanned by Slater determinants with unperturbed excitation energy up to $N_{max}\hbar\Omega$



solving the eigenvalue problem:

$$\mathsf{H} \left| \Psi_n \right\rangle = E_n \left| \Psi_n \right\rangle$$

• model space: spanned b problem of NCSM unpertul enormous increase of model space with particle number A ons

e = 3



Importance Truncated NCSM

• a priori determination of relevant basis states via first-order perturbation theory $\langle \Phi_{\nu} | H_{int} | \Psi_{ref} \rangle$

 $\epsilon_{\nu} - \epsilon_{\rm ref}$

• **importance truncated space** spanned by basis states with $|\kappa_{\nu}| \ge \kappa_{\min}$

M





March 27 2017

M

- analyze the sensitivity of spectra on **low-energy constants** (c_i , c_D , c_E) and **cutoff** (Λ) of the chiral 3N interaction at N²LO
- why this is interesting:
 - **impact of N³LO contributions**: some N³LO diagrams can be absorbed into the N²LO structure by shifting the c_i constants

$$\bar{c}_1 = c_1 - \frac{g_A^2 M_\pi}{64\pi F_\pi^2}$$
, $\bar{c}_3 = c_3 + \frac{g_A^4 M_\pi}{16\pi F_\pi^2}$, $\bar{c}_4 = c_4 - \frac{g_A^4 M_\pi}{16\pi F_\pi^2}$ (Bernard et al.,
Ishikawa, Robilotta)

 uncertainty propagation: sizable variations of the c_i from different extractions (also affects NN)

 $c_1 = -1.23... - 0.76$, $c_3 = -5.94... - 3.20$, $c_4 = 3.40...5.40$ [GeV⁻¹]

 cutoff dependence: does the cutoff choice in the 3N interaction affect nuclear structure observables?

March 27 2017

- analyze the sensitivity of spectra on **low-energy constants** (c_i , c_D , c_E) and **cutoff** (Λ) of the chiral 3N interaction at N²LO
- why this is interesting:
 - **impact of N³LO contributions**: some N³LO diagrams can be absorbed into the N²LO structure by shifting the c_i constants

$$\bar{c}_1 = c_1 - \frac{g_A^2 M_\pi}{64\pi F_\pi^2}$$
, $\bar{c}_3 = c_3 + \frac{g_A^4 M_\pi}{16\pi F_\pi^2}$, $\bar{c}_4 = c_4 - \frac{g_A^4 M_\pi}{16\pi F_\pi^2}$ (Bernard et al.,
Ishikawa, Robilotta)

- uncertainty propagation: sizable provide different extractions (also affects NN' constraints for chiral $c_1 = -1.23... - 0.76$, $c_3 = -5.94... - 3$ Hamiltonians and quantify
- cutoff dependence: does the cutoff uncertainties __raction affect nuclear structure observables?



- many states are rather *c_i* independent
- first 1+ state
 shows strong
 *c*₃ dependence

 $\begin{array}{l} \textbf{IT-NCSM} \\ \hbar\Omega = 16 \text{ MeV} \\ N_{\text{max}} = 8 \\ \alpha = 0.08 \, \text{fm}^4 \end{array} \end{array}$

¹²C: Sensitivity to *c_D* and cutoff



- moderate
 dependence
 on *C*_D,
 stronger
 dependence
 on Λ
- again first 1⁺ state is most sensitive

 $N_{\rm max} = 8$ $\alpha = 0.08 \, {\rm fm}^4$

IT-NCSM $\hbar \Omega = 16$ MeV

Correlation Analysis: ${}^{12}C(1^+)$ vs. ${}^{10}B(1^+)$



- correlation does not agree with experiment
- hints at problems with E&M NN interaction





RIUMF



;e



RIUMF



small cutoff dependence for NN+3N

;e

RTRIUMF

29

0

ndence on Chiral Order





Correlation Analysis: ¹²C(1⁺) vs. ¹⁰B(1⁺)





Outline





PRL 117, 242501 (2016)

RIUMF

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS

week ending 9 DECEMBER 2016

Can *Ab Initio* Theory Explain the Phenomenon of Parity Inversion in ¹¹Be?

Angelo Calci,^{1,*} Petr Navrátil,^{1,†} Robert Roth,² Jérémy Dohet-Eraly,^{1,‡} Sofia Quaglioni,³ and Guillaume Hupin^{4,5}

¹TRIUMF, 4004 Wesbrook Mall, Vancouver, British Columbia V6T 2A3, Canada

²Institut für Kernphysik, Technische Universität Darmstadt, 64289 Darmstadt, Germany

³Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, P.O. Box 808, L-414, Livermore, California 94551, USA

⁴Institut de Physique Nucléaire, Université Paris-Sud, IN2P3/CNRS, F-91406 Orsay Cedex, France ⁵CEA, DAM, DIF, F-91297 Arpajon, France

Spectrum



7.3139 ⁹Be+2n

parity inversion shell model predicts

g.s. to be $J^{\Pi}=1/2^{-1}$



Halo structure

weakly bound J=1/2 states spectrum dominated by n-¹⁰Be



Neutron-rich halo Nucleus ¹¹Be

PRL 117, 242501 (2016)

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS

week ending 9 DECEMBER 2016



Can Ab Initio Theory Explain the Phenomenon of Parity Inversion in ¹¹Be?



Neutron-rich halo Nucleus ¹¹Be

PRL 117, 242501 (2016)

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS

week ending 9 DECEMBER 2016



Can *Ab Initio* Theory Explain the Phenomenon of Parity Inversion in ¹¹Be?



Neutron-rich halo Nucleus ¹¹Be

PRL 117, 242501 (2016)

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS

week ending 9 DECEMBER 2016



Can *Ab Initio* Theory Explain the Phenomenon of Parity Inversion in ¹¹Be?

NCSM with Continuum (NCSMC)

• representing H $|\Psi^{J\pi T}\rangle = E |\Psi^{J\pi T}\rangle$ using the **over-complete basis**

$$\Psi^{J\pi T} \rangle = \sum_{\lambda} c_{\lambda} \left| \Psi_{A} E_{\lambda} J^{\pi} T \right\rangle + \sum_{\nu} \int dr r^{2} \frac{\chi_{\nu}(r)}{r} \left| \xi_{\nu r}^{J\pi T} \right|^{2}$$

expansion in A-body NCSM eigenstates relative motion of clusters NCSM/RGM expansion

leads to NCSMC equation

$$\begin{pmatrix} H_{NCSM} & h \\ h & \mathcal{H} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} c \\ \chi(r)/r \end{pmatrix} = E \begin{pmatrix} \mathbb{1} & g \\ g & \mathbb{1} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} c \\ \chi(r)/r \end{pmatrix}$$

• with 3N contributions in

$$H_{NCSM}$$
 h \mathcal{H}
covered by
NCSM $\langle \Psi_A E_{\lambda'} J^{\pi} T | H | \xi_{\mathcal{V}r}^{J\pi T} \rangle$
March 27 2017 Angelo Calci



¹¹Be: Ab initio NCSMC calculations

Halo structure

spectrum dominated by n-¹⁰Be halo structure



NCSM input

- calculations use NCSM vectors and energies as input
- include n-¹⁰Be continuum (0+,2+,2+ states of ¹⁰Be)
- include ¹¹Be short-range correlations:
 - 4 negative parity (at least)3 positive parity states of ¹¹Be

March 27 2017



¹¹Be: Ab initio NCSMC calculations

NCSM input

and energies as input

calculations use NCSM vectors

• Halo structure

spectrum dominated by n-¹⁰Be halo structure





¹¹Be excitation spectrum



March 27 2017



¹¹Be excitation spectrum



March 27 2017



¹¹Be excitation spectrum



March 27 2017

^{® TRIUMF} ¹¹Be: Photodisintegration process & E1 transition

B(E1	:1/2	→1/2+)	[e ² fm	2]

	NCSM	NCSMC	NCSMC- pheno	exp.	
NN+3N(400)	0.0005	-	0.146	0.102(2)*	
N ² LO _{SAT}	0.0005	0.127	0.117		

*Kwan et al. Phys. Lett. B 732, 210 (2014)

- **strongest known E1** transition between low-lying states (attributed to halo structure)
- reproduced only with continuum effects



- conflicting experimental measurements
- ab initio results:
 - discriminate between measurements
 - **predict dip** at 3/2⁻ resonance energy



Mirror nuclei:¹¹Be and ¹¹N



March 27 2017

p+10C Scattering: Structure of 11N resonances

Mirror System elastic scattering allows discrimination among chiral nuclear forces



A. Calci, P. Navratil, G. Hupin, S. Quaglioni, R. Roth et al. with IRIS collaboration, in preparation

A. Kumar, R. Kanungo, A. Sanetullaev et al.

p+10C Scattering: Structure of 11N resonances

Mirror System elastic scattering allows discrimination among chiral nuclear forces



IRIS collaboration: A. Kumar, R. Kanungo, A. Sanetullaev *et al.*

A. Calci, P. Navratil, G. Hupin, S. Quaglioni, R. Roth et al. with IRIS collaboration, in preparation

p+10C Scattering: Structure of 11N resonances

Mirror System elastic scattering allows discrimination among chiral nuclear forces





NCSMC with approximated 3N forces

with P. Navrátil, R. Roth, E. Gebrerufael

NCSM with Continuum (NCSMC)

• representing $H |\Psi^{J\pi T}\rangle = E |\Psi^{J\pi T}\rangle$ using the **over-complete basis**

$$|\Psi^{J\pi T}\rangle = \sum_{\lambda} c_{\lambda} |\Psi_{A}E_{\lambda}J^{\pi}T\rangle + \sum_{\nu} \int dr r^{2} \frac{\chi_{\nu}(r)}{r} |\xi_{\nu r}^{J\pi T}\rangle$$

expansion in A-body relative NCSM
NCSM eigenstates NCSN
• leads to NCSMC equation
$$\begin{pmatrix} H_{NCSM} & h \\ H \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} c \\ \chi(r)/r \end{pmatrix} = E \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ g \end{pmatrix}$$

• with 3N contributions in $H_{NCSM} \qquad h$
covered by NCSM given by $(\Psi_{A}E_{\lambda}J^{\pi}T|H|\xi_{\nu r}^{J\pi T})$
NCSM $(\Psi_{A}E_{\lambda}J^{\pi}T|H|\xi_{\nu r}^{J\pi T})$

Normal-ordering (NO) approximation

- standard tool to reduce particle rank
- generally NO can be considered as basis transformation

contain information of reference state and initial 3N force

- interested in direct description of **open-shell systems**
 - multi-reference normal ordering (MR-NO)

 $V_{3N} \approx \tilde{V}_{0N} + \tilde{V}_{1N} + \tilde{V}_{2N} + \tilde{V}_{3N}$

• generalization of wicks theorem [Kutzelnigg, Mukherjee]

NCSM/RGM kernels with MR-NO contributions

- reduces computational costs tremendously
- impressively accurate approximation



Derive NCSM/RGM Kernels

0B kernel

dominant 0B kernel contribution included in target eigenstates ⇒ only MR-NO 1B and 2B kernels contribute

1B kernel

 $_{SD} < \epsilon_{\nu'n'}^{\mathcal{J}\pi T} | \boldsymbol{V}_A | \epsilon_{\nu n}^{\mathcal{J}\pi T} >_{SD}$

- $= \sum_{M_1m_j} \sum_{M_{T_1}m_t} \sum_{M'_1m'_j} \sum_{M'_{T_1}m'_t} \left(\begin{array}{ccc} I_1 & j & | \mathcal{J} \\ M_1 & m_j & | \mathcal{M} \end{array} \right) \left(\begin{array}{ccc} T_1 & \frac{1}{2} & | T \\ M_{T_1} & m_t & | M_T \end{array} \right) \left(\begin{array}{ccc} I'_1 & j' & | \mathcal{J} \\ M'_1 & m'_j & | \mathcal{M} \end{array} \right) \left(\begin{array}{ccc} T'_1 & \frac{1}{2} & | T \\ M'_{T_1} & m'_t & | M_T \end{array} \right)$
- $\times \quad _{SD} < \psi_{A-1}' E_1' I_1'^{\pi_1'} M_1' T_1' M_{T_1}' |\psi_{A-1} E_1 I_1^{\pi_1} M_1 T_1 M_{T_1} >_{SD}$
- $\times \quad < n'l'j'm'_j\frac{1}{2}m'_t|V_A|nljm_j\frac{1}{2}m_t >$
- $-_{SD} < \epsilon_{\nu'n'}^{\mathcal{J}\pi T} | \boldsymbol{V}_{A} \boldsymbol{T}_{A-1,A} | \epsilon_{\nu n}^{\mathcal{J}\pi T} >_{SD}$ $= -\frac{1}{A-1} \sum_{M_{1}m_{j}} \sum_{M_{T_{1}}m_{t}} \sum_{M'_{1}m'_{j}} \sum_{M'_{T_{1}}m'_{t}} \left(\begin{array}{cc} I_{1} & j & | \mathcal{J} \\ M_{1} & m_{j} & | \mathcal{M} \end{array} \right) \left(\begin{array}{cc} T_{1} & \frac{1}{2} & | T \\ M_{T_{1}} & m_{t} & | M_{T} \end{array} \right) \left(\begin{array}{cc} I_{1}' & j' & | \mathcal{J} \\ M_{1}' & m_{j}' & | \mathcal{M} \end{array} \right) \left(\begin{array}{cc} T_{1}' & \frac{1}{2} & | T \\ M_{1}' & m_{j}' & | \mathcal{M} \end{array} \right) \left(\begin{array}{cc} T_{1}' & \frac{1}{2} & | T \\ M_{1}' & m_{j}' & | \mathcal{M} \end{array} \right)$
- $\times \sum_{\alpha_{A-1}} SD < \psi_{A-1}' E_1' I_1'^{\pi_1'} M_1' T_1' M_{T_1}' | \boldsymbol{a}_{nljm_jm_t}^{\dagger} \boldsymbol{a}_{\alpha_{A-1}} | \psi_{A-1} E_1 I_1^{\pi_1} M_1 T_1 M_{T_1} >_{SD}$
- $\times \quad < n'l'j'm'_j\frac{1}{2}m'_t|\boldsymbol{V}_A|\alpha_{A-1} >$

2B kernel



NCSMC: Impact of 3N in Kernels





NCSMC: Impact of 3N in Kernels





First application: ¹²N

• ideal candidate

weakly bound J=1+ state dominated by p-11C



- some low lying resonances not measured precisely
- ${}^{11}C(p,\gamma){}^{12}N$ can bypass triple-alpha process
- planed experiment at TUDA facility at TRIUMF

ab initio NCSMC

- include p-¹¹C continuum
 (3/2⁻, 1/2⁻, 5/2⁻, 3/2⁻ states of ¹¹C)
- include 4 negative and 6 positive parity states of ¹²N
- MR-NO with respect to N_{max}=0 eigenstate of ¹²N

RTRIUMF

¹²N spectrum with continuum effects



¹²N spectrum with continuum effects



March 27 2017





Probe chiral interaction in light nuclear scattering



n-4He: Standard interaction





n-4He with N²LO_{SAT}



- $P_{3/2}$ $P_{1/2}$ splitting sensitive to details of nuclear force
- under- or overestimated by NN+3N(400) or N²LO_{SAT} interaction



n-4He with LENPIC interaction



splitting underestimated without 3N interaction

 $\hbar\Omega = 24 \,\mathrm{MeV}$ $\alpha = 0.08 \,\mathrm{fm}^4$ $E_{3max} = 14$



n-4He with LENPIC interaction



March 27 2017



n-4He with N4LO(500) interaction



promising splitting properties of N⁴LO(500) NN interaction



Outlook

- **insufficient knowledge of nuclear force** provides largest uncertainties in ab initio calculations
- **p-shell spectra** provide powerful testbed for chiral potential
- combination of NCSMC with MR-NO allows to include continuum effects at strongly reduced cost
 - enables heavier targets and **complex projectiles**
 - probe future interactions in weakly-bound system
 - splitting of P_{3/2} P_{1/2} phase shifts in n-4He can be used to constrain 3N interaction

RIUMF

Thank you! Merci!

thanks to my collaborators

- P. Navrátil, R. Stroberg, J. Holt, R. Kanungo, G. Hackman, A. Kumar, A. Lennarz TRIUMF Vancouver, Canada
- R. Roth, E. Gebrerufael, K. Hebeler,
 A. Schwenk
 TU Darmstadt, Germany
- J. Vary, P. Maris Iowa State University, USA
- J. Dohet-Eraly Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare, Pisa, Italy







- S. Quaglioni, C. Romero-Redondo LLNL Livermore, USA
- G. Hupin
 Université Paris-Sud, France
- H. Hergert, S. Bogner MSU, USA





4004 Wesbrook Mall | Vancouver BC | Canada V6T 2A3 | Tel 604.222.1047 | Fax 604.222.1074 www.triumf.ca