



Hadron Structure

James Zanotti The University of Adelaide

Lattice Summer School, August 6 - 24, 2012, INT, Seattle, USA

Lecture 1 - Recap

- Elastic scattering
 - Form factors
 - Surprises in their Q² dependence
 - Density distributions in a hadron
- Lattice techniques
 - Three-point functions via sequential source method
 - Extraction of matrix elements

Lecture 2 - all about Form Factors

- Extracting matrix elements from Lattice three-point functions
- Extracting form factors from matrix elements
- Lattice nucleon form factors
 - Compare with experiment
 - Investigation of systematic errors
 - Flavour dependence
- Lattice pion form factor
 - Twisted boundary conditions
- Other hadron form factors

Extracting Matrix Elements

• Recall hadronic form of the nucleon 3pt function

 $G_{\Gamma}(t,\tau,\vec{p},\vec{p}',\mathcal{O}) = \sum_{s,s'} e^{-E_{\vec{p}\,'}(t-\tau)} e^{-E_{\vec{p}\,\tau}} \Gamma_{\beta\alpha} \langle \Omega \big| \chi_{\alpha}(0) \big| N(p',s') \rangle \langle N(p',s') \big| \mathcal{O}(\vec{q}) \big| N(p,s) \rangle \langle Np,s) \big| \overline{\chi}_{\beta}(0) \big| \Omega \rangle$

Need to remove time dependence and wave function amplitudes

Form a ratios with the nucleon 2pt function

$$G_2(t, \vec{p}) = \sum_s e^{-E_p t} \Gamma_{\beta \alpha} \langle \Omega | \chi_{\alpha} | N(p, s) \rangle \langle N(p, s) | \overline{\chi}_{\beta} | \Omega \rangle$$
• E.g.

$$R(t,\tau;\vec{p}',\vec{p};\mathcal{O}) = \frac{G_{\Gamma}(t,\tau;\vec{p}',\vec{p},\mathcal{O})}{G_{2}(t,\vec{p}')} \left[\frac{G_{2}(\tau,\vec{p}')G_{2}(t,\vec{p}')G_{2}(t-\tau,\vec{p})}{G_{2}(\tau,\vec{p})G_{2}(t,\vec{p})G_{2}(t-\tau,\vec{p}')} \right]^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

Extracting Matrix Elements

Using the relation for spinors

$$\bar{u}(\vec{p},\sigma')\Gamma u(\vec{p},\sigma) = \mathrm{Tr}\Gamma(E\gamma_4 - i\vec{p}\cdot\vec{\gamma} + m)\frac{1}{2}\left(1 - \gamma_5\gamma_4\frac{\vec{p}\cdot\vec{s}}{EM} + i\gamma_5\frac{\vec{\gamma}\cdot\vec{s}}{m}\right)\delta_{\sigma\sigma}$$

• We can write the two point function as

$$G_2(t,\vec{p}) = \sum_s \frac{\sqrt{Z^{\text{snk}}(\vec{p})}\sqrt{\overline{Z}^{\text{src}}(\vec{p})}}{2E_{\vec{p}}} \operatorname{Tr}\bar{u}(\vec{p},s)\Gamma u(\vec{p},s)[e^{-E_pt} + e^{-E'_{\vec{p}}(T-t)}] \qquad \text{with opposite}$$
 parity

• Use $\Gamma_4 = \frac{1}{2}(1 + \gamma_4)$ to maximise overlap with positive parity forward propagating state $G_2(t, \vec{p}) = \sqrt{Z^{\mathrm{snk}}(\vec{p})\overline{Z}^{\mathrm{src}}(\vec{p})} \left[\left(\frac{E_{\vec{p}} + m}{E_{\vec{p}}} \right) e^{-E_p t} + \left(\frac{E'_{\vec{p}} + m'}{E'_{\vec{p}}} \right) e^{-E'_{\vec{p}}(T-t)} \right]$ $\log(G_2)^{\frac{29}{-4}} \int_{-\frac{1}{24}}^{\frac{29}{-4}} \int_{-\frac{1}{24}}^{\frac{29}{-$

Extracting Matrix Elements

 Similarly for the three-point function, if we express the nucleon matrix element under study as

$$\langle N(p', s') | \mathcal{O}(\vec{q}) | N(p, s) \rangle = \bar{u}(p', s') \mathcal{J}u(p, s)$$

• E.g., for the EM current ${\cal O}=J^{\mu}$

$$\mathcal{J} = \gamma^{\mu} F_1(Q^2) + i\sigma^{\mu\nu} \frac{q_{\nu}}{2M} F_2(Q^2)$$

• Then we have

$$G_3(t,\tau;\vec{p}'\vec{p};\Gamma,\mathcal{O}) = \sqrt{Z^{\mathrm{snk}}(\vec{p}')\overline{Z}^{\mathrm{src}}(\vec{p})}F(\Gamma,\mathcal{J})e^{-E_{\vec{p}'}(t-\tau)}e^{-E_{\vec{p}'}\tau}$$

• where

$$F(\Gamma, \mathcal{J}) = \frac{1}{4} \operatorname{Tr} \left\{ \Gamma \left(\gamma_4 - i \frac{\vec{p'} \cdot \vec{\gamma}}{E_{\vec{p'}}} + \frac{m}{E_{\vec{p'}}} \right) \mathcal{J} \left(\gamma_4 - i \frac{\vec{p} \cdot \vec{\gamma}}{E_{\vec{p}}} + \frac{m}{E_{\vec{p}}} \right) \right\}$$

Example

• If we consider the particular case

$$\Gamma = \Gamma_{\text{unpol}} \equiv \frac{1}{2}(1 + \gamma_4), \ \mathcal{O} = J^{\mu}, \ \vec{p}' = \vec{p} \Rightarrow q = 0$$

• then the contribution from F_2 to the matrix element drops out (proportional to q)

$$\langle N(p', s')|J^{\mu}(0)|N(p, s)\rangle = \bar{u}(p', s')\gamma^{\mu}u(p, s)F_1(Q^2 = 0) + \bar{u}(p', s')i\frac{\sigma^{\mu\nu}q_{\nu}}{2M}u(p, s)F_2(Q^2 = 0)$$

• Euclideanisation
$$\gamma_0^{\mathrm{M}} = \gamma_4^{\mathrm{E}}, \ \gamma_i^{\mathrm{M}} = -i\gamma_i^{\mathrm{E}}$$
 $p_4^{\mathrm{E}} = ip_0^{\mathrm{M}} \equiv iE(\vec{p}), \ p_i^{\mathrm{E}} = -p_i^{\mathrm{M}}$
 $\langle N(p', s') | \bar{q} \gamma_{\mu}^{\mathrm{E}} q | N(p, s) \rangle = \bar{u}(p', s') \gamma_{\mu}^{\mathrm{E}} u(p, s) F_1(Q^2 = 0) + \bar{u}(p', s') \frac{\sigma_{\mu\nu}^{\mathrm{E}} q_{\nu}^{\mathrm{E}}}{2M} u(p, s) F_2(Q^2 = 0)$

Using the local vector current $J^{\mu} = \bar{q}\gamma^{\mu}q$



$$F(\Gamma, \mathcal{J}) = \frac{1}{4} \operatorname{Tr} \left\{ \Gamma \left(\gamma_4 - i \frac{\vec{p}' \cdot \vec{\gamma}}{E_{\vec{p}'}} + \frac{m}{E_{\vec{p}'}} \right) \mathcal{J} \left(\gamma_4 - i \frac{\vec{p} \cdot \vec{\gamma}}{E_{\vec{p}}} + \frac{m}{E_{\vec{p}}} \right) \right\}$$

 $\vec{p} = \vec{p}' = 0$

• Then the three-point function is now

$$G_3(t,\tau;\vec{p}'\vec{p};\Gamma,\mathcal{O}) = \sqrt{Z^{\mathrm{snk}}(\vec{p}')}\overline{Z}^{\mathrm{src}}(\vec{p})F(\Gamma,\mathcal{J})e^{-E_{\vec{p}'}(t-\tau)}e^{-E_{\vec{p}'}\tau}$$

• with

 $\mathcal{J} = \gamma^{\mu} F_1(Q^2)$

and

$$F(\Gamma_{\text{unpol}}, \gamma_4) = \frac{1}{2E_{\vec{p}}E_{\vec{p'}}} \left[(E_{\vec{p}} + m)(E_{\vec{p'}} + m) + \vec{p'} \cdot \vec{p} \right] = 2$$

$$F(\Gamma_{\text{unpol}}, \gamma_i) = \frac{-i}{2E_{\vec{p}}E_{\vec{p}'}} \left[(E_{\vec{p}} + m)\vec{p}' + (E_{\vec{p}'} + m)\vec{p} \right] = 0$$

Example

• So our ratio determines

$$R(t,\tau;\vec{p}',\vec{p};\mathcal{O}) = \frac{G_{\Gamma}(t,\tau;\vec{p}',\vec{p},\mathcal{O})}{G_{2}(t,\vec{p}')} \left[\frac{G_{2}(\tau,\vec{p}')G_{2}(t,\vec{p}')G_{2}(t-\tau,\vec{p})}{G_{2}(\tau,\vec{p})G_{2}(t-\tau,\vec{p}')} \right]^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$= \sqrt{\frac{E_{\vec{p}'}E_{\vec{p}}}{(E_{\vec{p}}+m)(E_{\vec{p}}+m)}} F(\Gamma,\mathcal{J}_{\mathcal{O}}(\vec{q})) \quad 0 \ll \tau \ll t \ll \frac{1}{2}T$$

$$= F_{1}(q^{2}=0) \qquad \boxed{\Gamma_{\text{unpol}} = \frac{1}{2}(1+\gamma_{4}), \ \mathcal{O} = V_{4} \equiv \gamma_{4}, \ \vec{p}' = \vec{p} = 0}$$

$$R(t=16,\tau;\vec{p},\vec{p}';V_{4})$$

$$R(t=16,\tau;\vec{p},\vec{p}';V_{4})$$

t/a

Other Useful Combinations

Exercise: Prove them!



- Certain combinations of parameters and kinematics give access to the form factors
- It is possible to have several choices giving access to the form factors at a fixed Q²



Overdetermined set of simultaneous equations that can be solved for F_1 , F_2 Or G_F , G_M

Typical Examples

More detailed look at lattice results to follow



Some Recent Works

[Not an exhaustive list]

Nucleon

- Review: Ph. Hägler, 0912.5483
- QCDSF: 1106.3580
- ETMC: 1102.2208

- LHPC: 1001.3620
- RBC/UKQCD: 0904.2039
- CSSM: hep-lat/0604022

Pion

- Mainz: 1109.0196
- PACS-CS: 1102.3652
- JLQCD/TWQCD: 0905.2465

- ETMC: 0812.4042
- RBC/UKQCD: 0804.3971
- QCDSF: hep-lat/0608021

Recall





Recall





If a nucleon was a point-like object with no internal structure, a probe would simply measure its e.g. charge for all q²

Recall

$$\frac{d\sigma}{d\Omega} = \left(\frac{d\sigma}{d\Omega}\right)_{\text{point}} |F(q^2)|^2$$



If a nucleon was a point-like object with no internal structure, a probe would simply measure its e.g. charge for all q²

Recall

$$\frac{d\sigma}{d\Omega} = \left(\frac{d\sigma}{d\Omega}\right)_{\text{point}} |F(q^2)|^2$$



Example: Proton F₁ Form Factor



Example: Proton F₁ Form Factor



$$\langle p', s'|J^{\mu}(\vec{q})|p, s\rangle = \bar{u}(p', s') \left[\gamma^{\mu}F_1(q^2) + i\sigma^{\mu\nu}\frac{q_{\nu}}{2m}F_2(q^2)\right] u(p, s)$$

Electric charge

Anomalous magnetic moment

Magnetic moment

$$F_{1}(0) = Q$$

$$F_{2}(0) = \kappa$$

$$F_{1}(0) + F_{2}(0) = \mu$$

$$Q_{p} = 1, \ Q^{n} = 0$$

$$\mu_{p} = 2.79\mu_{N}, \ \mu_{n} = -1.91\mu_{N}$$

Radii:
$$r_i^2 = -6 \frac{dF_i(q^2)}{dq^2} \Big|_{q^2=0}$$

$$q^2 > 0$$
 : "Look inside" hadron

Scaling of Form Factors



Scaling of Form Factors



Scaling of Form Factors



Q² Parameterisation

 Sachs form factors reasonably described by a dipole

1

$$G_E^p(Q^2) = \frac{1}{(1+Q^2/M_D^2)^2}$$
$$G_M^{p,n}(Q^2) = \frac{\mu^{p,n}}{(1+Q^2/M_D^2)^2}$$

• with

$$M_D \approx 0.71 \,\text{GeV}$$

 $\mu^p = 2.79 \,\mu_N$
 $\mu^n = -1.91 \,\mu_N$

• But deviations seen, particularly at large Q²



Q² Parameterisation

[Phys. Rev. C 66, 065203 (2002)]

• Kelly proposed a simple parameterisation for the form factors



Form Factor Radii & Magnetic Moments

Search for non-analytic behaviour predicted by Chiral Perturbation Theory

[see lectures by B. Tiburzi]

Form factor radii:

$$r_i^2 = -6 \frac{dF_i(q^2)}{dq^2} \Big|_{q^2 = 0}$$

* Magnetic moment μ /anomalous magnetic moment κ



Form Factor Radii & Magnetic Moments

Search for non-analytic behaviour predicted by Chiral Perturbation Theory

[see lectures by B. Tiburzi]

Form factor radii:

$$r_i^2 = -6 \frac{dF_i(q^2)}{dq^2} \Big|_{q^2 = 0}$$

* Magnetic moment μ /anomalous magnetic moment κ



Lattice Nucleon Form Factors

Systematics of a Lattice Calculation

- In the following slides, we will be looking at lattice results for the EM form factors of the proton which can be compared with the experimental results
- We need to be careful of systematic errors that could affect our results
 - Finite lattice spacing
 - Large quark masses
 - Finite volume
 - Contamination from excited states
- Will focus on recent results from QCDSF PRD 84, 074507 (2011) [arXiv:1106.3580]

Comparison With Experiment



Comparison With Experiment



Systematic Errors Lattice Spacing

- Scan available datasets for bins with constant m_{π} , but with 3 or more different lattice spacings, *a*
- Plot results as a function of a^2



Grey band: parameterisation of experimental data

No visible dependence on a

Systematic Errors Volume

• Scan datasets for bins with constant m_{π} but with 2 or more spatial volumes, L



Systematic Errors Excited State Contamination

• For small values of Euclidean time, effects from excited states may adversely affect the extraction of physical observable from the lattice, e.g.

$$C_{2pt}(t) = A_0 e^{-M_0 t} + A_1 e^{-M_1 t} + \dots$$

- Require distances between source (t=0)- operator insertion (τ) sink $(t_{snk}) >> 1$
- Simulate with multiple t_{snk}'s on a single dataset to test the validity of our original choice t_{snk}=13



Systematic Errors

- Systematics appear to be under control
 - Finite lattice spacing
 - Large quark masses
 - Finite volume 🗸
 - Contamination from excited states
- Remaining discrepancy must come from unphysical quark masses





- Isovector Dirac radius (squared)
- Isovector Pauli radius (squared)
- Isovector anomalous magnetic moment
- Dirac radius: different experimental values

Light Quark Mass Dependence

- Radii suppressed at large masses and small volumes
- Hint of sharp rise at small masses
- r₂ approaching experimental result
- κ^{u-d} shows clear curvature at small masses
- Can the remaining discrepancy be due to the (still) unphysically large quark masses?
- Contact with ChPT?
- Popular expressions from Phys. Rev. D71, 034508 (2005) (SSE)
- But are they valid up to $\ m_\pi < 300 \,\, {
 m MeV}$?
- Check by: Varying unknown parameters over a "reasonable" range and extrapolate up from the chiral limit with the only constraint provided by the experimental point



Dirac Radius

- Rapidly decreasing isovector Dirac ms radius as pion mass increases
- Overlap with the lattice data points at $m_\pi \approx 250 \ldots 300 \; MeV$
- Similar observations for Pauli radius and anomalous magnetic moment
- Isoscalar r_1 indicates form not valid past physical pion mass



Flavour Distribution

- Individual flavour contributions not accessible directly in experiment
- Must be derived from a combination of proton and neutron form factors

• (assuming charge symmetry $u^{p} = d^{n}$)

$$F^{p} = \frac{2}{3}F^{p}_{u} - \frac{1}{3}F^{p}_{d}$$
$$F^{n} = -\frac{1}{3}F^{p}_{u} + \frac{2}{3}F^{p}_{d}$$

• On the lattice we compute the individual quark contributions directly

Flavour Distribution



Flavour Distribution

 In terms of charge radii, the d-quark in the proton has a larger charge radius than the u-quark



Implications for Transverse Densities



Pion Form Factor

$$\langle \pi(p') | J^{\mu}(\vec{q}) | \pi(p) \rangle = P^{\mu} F_{\pi}(q^2)$$

$$q^2 = -Q^2 = (p' - p)^2$$

 $P^{\mu} = p'^{\mu} + p^{\mu}$

Pion Form Factor

p

• Asymptotic normalisation known from $\pi \rightarrow \mu + \nu$ decay

$$F_{\pi}(Q^2 \to \infty) = \frac{16\pi\alpha_s(Q^2)f_{\pi}^2}{Q^2}$$

- Allows to study the transition from the soft to hard regimes
- Low Q²: measured directly by scattering high energy pions from atomic electrons [CERN]
- High Q²: quasi-elastic scattering off virtual pions [DESY & JLab]



simple_meson_seqsrc_w.cc	<pre>string("a0-a0"), mesA0A01SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-rho_x_1"), mesA0RhoX1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-rho_y_1"), mesA0RhoY1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-b1_z"), mesA0B1Z1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-rho_z_1"), mesA0RhoZ1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-b1_y"), mesA01B1Y1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-b1_x"), mesA01B1X1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-pion_2"), mesA01Pion2SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-a0_2"), mesA0A02SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-rho_x_2"), mesA0RhoX2SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-rho_y_2"), mesA0RhoY2SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-a1_z"), mesA0A1Z1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-rho_z_2"), mesA0RhoZ2SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-a1_y"), mesA0A1Y1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-a1_x"), mesA0A1X1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("a0-pion_1"), mesA0Pion1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("pion_1-pion_1"), mesPion1Pion1SeqSrc);</pre>
<pre>// keep for historical purposes success &= Chroma::TheWilsonHadronSeqSourceFactory::Instance().registerObject(</pre>	<pre>string("pion"), mesPion1Pion1SeqSrc);</pre>

Pion Form Factor

 $Q^2 = -q^2$



Pion Form Factor



Discretised Momentum

• On a periodic lattice with spatial volume L³, quark fields satisfy

$$\psi(x + \vec{e}_i L) = \psi(x), \quad i = 1, 2, 3$$
$$\int d^4 p \, e^{-ip(x + \vec{e}_i L)} \tilde{\psi}(p) = \int d^4 p \, e^{-ipx} \tilde{\psi}(p), \quad i = 1, 2, 3$$

• so we see that momenta are discretised in units of $p_i = \frac{2\pi}{L}n_i$, i = 1, 2, 3

- For typical lattices, smallest non-zero momentum ~400-500 MeV
- Poor momentum resolution
- Can affect phenomenological observables e.g. form factors

Accessing small momenta: (partially) twisted boundary conditions

• On a periodic lattice with spatial volume L³, quark fields satisfy

$$\psi(x + \vec{e}_i L) = \psi(x), \quad i = 1, 2, 3$$
$$\int d^4 p \, e^{-ip(x + \vec{e}_i L)} \tilde{\psi}(p) = \int d^4 p \, e^{-ipx} \tilde{\psi}(p), \quad i = 1, 2, 3$$
$$2\pi$$

- so we see that momenta are discretised in units of $p_i = rac{2\pi}{L} n_i, \quad i=1,\,2,\,3$
- Modify boundary conditions on the valence quarks

$$\psi(x + \vec{e}_i L) = e^{i\theta_i}\psi(x), \quad i = 1, 2, 3$$

• allows to tune the momenta continuously

$$p_i = \frac{2\pi}{L}n_i + \frac{\theta_i}{L}, \quad i = 1, 2, 3$$

• For a meson with quark flavours (1,2)

$$\vec{p} = \frac{2\pi}{L}\vec{n} + \frac{(\vec{\theta}_1 - \vec{\theta}_2)}{L}$$

Implementation

• Make a unitary Abelian transformation on the fields

$$\psi(x) \longrightarrow \mathcal{U}(\theta, x)\tilde{\psi}(x) = e^{\frac{i\theta \cdot \vec{x}}{L}}\tilde{\psi}(x)$$

 Phase factor cancels in all terms of the lattice fermion action except the spatial hopping term

$$\overline{\tilde{\psi}}(x) \left[e^{i\frac{a\theta_i}{L}} U_i(x)(1-\gamma_i)\tilde{\psi}(x+\hat{i}) + e^{-i\frac{a\theta_i}{L}} U_i^{\dagger}(x-\hat{i})(1+\gamma_i)\tilde{\psi}(x-\hat{i})(1-\gamma_i)\tilde{\psi}(x-\hat{$$

• In practice, compute quark propagator with gauge links

$$\{U_i(x)\} \longrightarrow \{e^{i\frac{a\theta_i}{L}}U_i(x)\}$$

- Twisted boundary conditions for sea quarks requires generating new set of gauge fields for each twist
 - only twist valence quarks *partially twisted boundary conditions*
 - Introduces an additional finite size effect that is, however, exponentially suppressed



Implementation

[RBC/UKQCD, hep-lat/0705005]



- Use different (twisted) boundary conditions when computing the propagators either side of the current
- E.g. One possibility would be

$$\vec{\theta}_{q_2} = \vec{\theta}_{q_3} = \vec{0}, \quad \vec{\theta}_{q_1} \neq \vec{0}$$

Pion charge radius

[RBC/UKQCD, arXiv:0804.3971]



Pion charge radius

[RBC/UKQCD, 0804.3971]





Pion Form Factor

[Mainz: 1109.0196]



Other Hadron Form Factors

- Pion and nucleon form factors have received the most attention
- Small amount of work on form factors of other hadrons, e.g.

 Hyperons 	CSSM: hep-lat/0604022, QCDSF: 1101.2806,
	H-W.Lin et al.: 0812.4456

- Delta CSSM: 0902.4046, Alexandrou et al.: 0810.3976
- Rho CSSM: hep-lat/0703014, QCDSF: PoS LAT2008, 051
- $\gamma N \rightarrow \Delta$ transition Alexandrou et al.: 1011.3233

• Non-zero quadrupole moment hadron deformation Review: [Alexandrou et al.: 1201.4511]